

**BRIEF HISTORY OF
THE CHARISMATIC
MOVEMENT,
CHRISTIAN
MYSTICISM, AND
LET-GO-LET-GOD**

Brief History of the Charismatic Movement,
Christian Mysticism, and Let-Go-Let-God

The contents of this book may be freely reproduced
in whole or in part except for the cover photo
which is used by permission.

Cover Photo: Street of Ancient Corinth

May 11, 2020

Wayne ODonnell

ISBN: 9798645149918

To

Garry Friesen

for his book

Decision Making and the Will of God:

A Biblical Alternative to the Traditional View

Contents

Contents	5
Tables	7
Introduction.....	9
100-1650. Early Movements.....	18
135 AD. Montanists.....	18
370-1340 AD. Euchites, Free Spirits, Friends of God..	19
1526-1534. Tyndale's New Testament and the Anglican Church.....	19
1650. English Dissenters.....	20
1650-1685. Let Go and Let God.....	21
1650. George Fox (Quaker), The Light Within	21
1678. Barclay (Quaker). Apology for True Christian Divinity	23
1680. Marshall (Puritan). The Gospel Mystery of Sanctification	23
1685-1700. Roman Catholic Mystics	24
1685. Madame Guyon	24
1685. Miguel de Molinos.....	25
1699. Francois Fenelon.....	28
Gene Edwards on Guyon, Molinos, & Fenelon.....	30
1766-1858. The Sinless Perfection Movement	43
1734-1748. The First Great Awakening.....	43
1766. Wesley. Plain Account of Christian Perfection...	45
1771. Fletcher. Last Check to Antinomianism.....	48
1775. Methodism in Virginia.....	49
1801. The Cane Ridge Camp Meeting.....	50
1800-1850. The Second Great Awakening	50
1820. Charles Finney	51
1823. The Mormons.....	53

1832. The Catholic Apostolic Church 53

1832. Spiritual Wives 55

1846. John Humphrey Noyes..... 56

1843. The Higher Life Movement Splits Off..... 57

 1843. Phoebe Palmer. The Way of Holiness57

 1858. Boardman. The Higher Christian Life.....57

 1875. Smith. The Christians Secret to a Happy Life.... 62

 1923. Charles Trumbull, The Victorious Life 72

 1907-2019. Keswick and America’s Keswick..... 79

1867-1906. The Holiness Movement..... 82

 1867. The National Holiness Association..... 82

 1871. Charles Finney..... 83

 1891. R. C. Horner. Pentecost 85

 1894. The Southern Methodist Church Statement 86

 1895. Irwin’s Fire-Baptized Holiness Church 86

 1897. Mason’s Church of God in Christ..... 87

 1896. Tomlinson’s Church of God (Cleveland, Tennessee)..... 88

 1898. Holmes Theological Seminary..... 89

 1900. Crumpler’s Pentecostal Holiness Church..... 89

 1900. Alexander Dowie91

 1900. The Church of the Nazarene..... 92

 1904. The Welsh Revival 92

 1912. H. A. Ironside Criticism 92

1906-1959. The Pentecostal Movement 93

 1900. Charles Fox Parham 93

 1905. William Joseph Seymour..... 94

 1906. Azusa Street 95

 1906. Garr and Barratt 96

 1906. Cashwell..... 98

 1908. Absorption of Fire Baptized Holiness Church .. 99

 1910. Finished Work Controversy 99

1914. The Assemblies of God100

1916. Jesus Name, Oneness, Pentecostal Unitarians.100

1946-1955. William Branham (1909-1965) 101

1948. Latter Rain Movement102

1952. Full Gospel Business Men’s Fellowship (FGBMF)
.....103

1959-1994. The Charismatic Movement..... 104

1959. Dennis Bennett’s Episcopalian Charismatics...104

1967. Duquesne, Pittsburgh Catholic Charismatics ..104

1968. Jesus People 105

1970-1975. Shepherding Ministry..... 106

1974. Vineyard Churches 106

1977. Kansas City Conference106

1982. Kansas City Prophets 107

1990. Promise Keepers112

1992-1977. Lakeland, Toronto Blessing, Brownsville.113

1994-2020. The Apostles and Prophets Movement ...114

1994. New Apostolic Reformation (NAR).....114

1996. Bethel Church, Redding 118

2012. Judy Franklin & Ellyn Davis. The Physics of
Heaven 118

2020. Caravan of Unity.....120

20??-20??. The Apostacy120

Bibliography..... 129

Tables

Mysticism vs the Word - Salvation and Edification31

Mysticism vs the Word - Union with God.....31

8 Charismatic Movement, Mysticism, & Let-Go-Let-God

Mysticism vs the Word - Becoming Like Jesus	32
Mysticism vs the Word - How to Pray	33
Mysticism vs the Word - Do Nothing or Work Hard?	34
Mysticism vs the Word - Do Nothing or Work Hard?	36
Mysticism vs the Word - Overcoming Sin (1)	37
Mysticism vs the Word - Overcoming Sin (2)	38
Mysticism vs the Word - Annihilation or Intentional Thinking?	39
Mysticism vs the Word - Be Detached or Involved?	40
Mysticism vs the Word - Unseen Realms or the Word?	41

Introduction

All my books can be read online for free at <http://wayneodonnell.com> or <http://bible.ag>. “Freely you have received, freely give” (Mt. 10:8).

This booklet is included in and comprises one section in my book “Paul’s Decision Making in Acts: Anti-Charismatic, Pro-Jewish.”

The history of the Charismatic Movement, Christian Mysticism, and the Let-Go-Let-God doctrine is the history of both misinterpreting the Bible, and also of seeking something more than the Bible. It’s about wanting to get something quick and exciting after justification and before glorification, instead of just diligently laboring using the new mind to serve and battle.

Rom. 7:6. Now ... we ... serve in newness of spirit.

Rom. 8:3-9. They that are after the flesh [all the unsaved] do mind [think about and love] the things of the flesh; but they that are after the Spirit [all who have been justified, think about and love] the things of the Spirit [the Word]. For to be carnally minded is death, but to be spiritually minded is life and peace. Because the carnal mind is hatred against God. ... So then they that are in the flesh [all the unsaved] can’t please God. But you [all who have been justified] are not in the flesh, but in the Spirit, since the Spirit of God dwells in you. Now if any man doesn’t have the Spirit of Messiah [only the unsaved], he is none of his.

Biblically, there's no shortcut to sanctification. After we're justified, we learn and labor, using the new mind, and the next event is glorification.

1 Ths. 1:9. You turned to God from idols [past spiritual justification event], to serve the living and true God [present sanctification process], and to wait for his Son from heaven [future physical glorification event].

The greatest hindrance to more complete practical sanctification, is the false doctrine of “let go and let God,” as taught by John Wesley (sinless perfectionism), Phoebe Palmer (altar theology), William Boardman (higher life), Hannah Whitall Smith (secret of a happy Christian life), the Keswick Convention (resting faith), Charles Trumbull (victorious life), and many others. As Watchman Nee said:

Nee (1903-1972). From now on I will not do anything, I will not manage anything, and I will not be concerned about anything. From now on I will let go. Brothers and sisters, this is surrendering. This is letting go.

But the Bible says:

Jesus. Mt. 9:38. Pray ... the Lord ... will send forth laborers into his harvest.

Mary, Tryphena, Tryphosa, and Persis. Rom. 16:6, 12. Mary ... bestowed much labor on us. ... Tryphena and Tryphosa ... labor in the Lord. ... Persis ... labored much in the Lord.

The Thessalonians. 1 Ths. 1:3. Remembering without ceasing your work of faith, and labor of love, and patience of hope.

Epaphroditus. Phil. 2:25. Epaphroditus, my ... companion in labor, and fellow soldier, ... and he that ministered to my wants.

Clement and Others. Phil. 4:2-4. True yokefellow, help those women which labored with me in the gospel, with Clement also, and with my other fellow laborers.

Epaphras. Col. 4:12. Epaphras, ... a servant of Messiah, ... [is] always laboring fervently for you in prayers.

The Ephesians. Rev. 2:2-3. I know your works, and your labor, and your patience, ... and for my name's sake has labored, and has not fainted.

It's true God's grace works in us. But we mustn't therefore draw the conclusion that "from now on I will not do anything. ... I will let go" (Watchman Nee). The biblical response to knowing God gives us a desire and ability to do his will, is to have confidence to work harder.

Phil. 2:12-14. As you have always obeyed, not as in my presence only, but now much more in my absence, WORK out your own salvation with fear and trembling, because it's God which works in you both to will and to do of his good pleasure. DO all things without murmurings.

The mystic says, if we try to work with God, we will sabotage his efforts.

Guyon. One of the most important things you can do is cease from any self-effort. In this way, God Himself can act alone.

Trumbull. He does it all. We do not dare to help. ... Our efforts can not only never play any part in our victory over the power of sin, but they can and do effectually prevent such victory.

But the Bible says WE are to work, labor, and strive, since HE works in us. The mystics' conclusion is wrong, that therefore we must not work. The biblical conclusion is that therefore we have confidence to work even harder.

Col. 1:28-29. WE preach, warning every man, and teaching every man in all wisdom, that we may present every man perfect in Messiah Jesus, whereto I ALSO LABOR, STRIVING according to his working, which works in me mightily.

1 Cor. 3:58. Be... always abounding in the work of the Lord, ... [for] YOUR labor is not in vain in the Lord.

1 Cor. 16:16. Submit yourselves ... to every one that helps with us and labors.

1 Ths. 5:12-13. Know them which labor among you, ... and ... esteem them very highly in love for THEIR work's sake.

1 Tim. 4:8-10. Bodily exercise profits little, but godliness is profitable to all things, ... therefore, WE both labor and suffer reproach.

Brethren will receive differing amounts of rewards, not for having received differing amounts of grace, because that's not under our control (though pride can hinder, Jam. 4:6), but for what we do with whatever amount of grace we're given.

1 Cor. 3:8-9. Every man shall receive his OWN reward according to his OWN labor, for we are laborers together WITH God.

2 Cor. 5:9-10. WE labor, ... for we must all appear before the judgment seat of Messiah; that every one may receive the things done in his body, according to what HE [every person] has done.

Paul received special grace, because as Jesus' representative, God couldn't allow him to fail. Paul couldn't receive a reward for preaching, because he had no choice but to preach. But he could receive a reward for doing it willingly, rather than unwillingly, and by refusing to accept financial support which was rightfully due him from Congregations.

1 Cor. 15:10. I labored more abundantly than they all; yet not I, but the grace of God which was with me.

1 Cor. 9:16-18. For though I preach the gospel, I have nothing to boast of, for necessity is laid on me [through apostolic grace]. ... For if I do this thing willingly, I have a reward; but if against my will, [God will still ensure he preaches, because as an apostle] a dispensation of the gospel is committed to me. [How do I get a] reward then? Truly that, when I preach the gospel, I may [do it willingly, and] make the gospel of Messiah without charge.

There will come a time for us to cease from our efforts and enter rest. But not before we die or the Lord returns.

Rev. 14:12-14. Here is the patience of the saints. ... Write, "Blessed are the dead which die in the Lord from henceforth." "Yes," says the Spirit, "that they may rest from their labors, and their works do follow them [for rewards]."

The mystics say you have to use an indirect approach. Have faith to receive sanctification, and then that sanctification will result in your doing effortless work. But this isn't taught in the Bible. The ox doesn't just have faith which results in the corn being treaded out by him. He takes step after step, though muscles ache, and pushes on until all the corn is ground.

1 Tim. 5:17. Let the elders that rule well be counted worthy of double honor, especially they who LABOR in the word and doctrine. For the scripture says, "You shall not muzzle the ox that TREADS OUT THE CORN." And, "The laborer is worthy of HIS reward."

Paul knew nothing of effortless work. He felt the fatigue of his labors, just as he felt each lash of the whip.

2 Cor. 11:23. Are they servants of Messiah? ... I am more. In labors more abundant, in stripes above measure, in prisons more frequent.

Paul says we're justified by faith, not works. And justification ensures the certainty of our sanctification because we're regenerated and

receive the indwelling Spirit the moment we're justified. But our efforts determine the amount of our sanctification, "some an hundredfold, some sixty, some thirty" (Mt. 13:23).

Some mystics say have faith, do nothing, avoid all thinking and reasoning, and you'll receive effortless sanctification.

Molinos. I have given myself to His presence by an act of faith. ... The simpler your remembrance is - without words or thoughts - the ... [more] undistorted relationship with the Lord who abides in you. To lay hold of the silence of thought is to arrive and abide at the center of your being, where Christ dwells. By not ... reasoning, we reach the central place ... where God speaks to our inward man. ... It is in that place that He transforms you into Himself. [Edwards, Secret Place, 21, 67.]

But the biblical method of sanctification is, after justification by faith, to use the Word and reasoning to motivate ourselves to work as hard as we possibly can.

Rom. 6:6-11. Knowing this ..., knowing that ..., reckon you also yourselves ...

Rom. 12:2. Don't be conformed to this world, but be transformed, by the renewing of your mind.

Rom. 5:3. We rejoice in tribulations, ... knowing that tribulation produces patience.

2 Cor. 5:11. Knowing therefore the terror of the Lord, we persuade men.

Eph. 6:6-8. As the servants of Christ, ... doing service, knowing that whatever good thing any man does, the same shall he receive of the Lord.

Heb. 10:34. [You] took joyfully the spoiling of your goods, knowing ... that you have in heaven a better and ... enduring substance.

Eph. 20:20. I ... taught you publicly, and from house to house. ... Wherefore I take you to record this day, that I am pure from the blood of all men. ... Take heed therefore ... to all the flock, ... which he has purchased with his own blood. For I know ... that after my departing grievous wolves will enter in among you, not sparing the flock. ... Therefore ... remember, that by the space of three years I ceased not to warn every one night and day with tears.

Jn. 21:6. Simon, do you love me? ... Feed my sheep.

1 Cor. 15:58. Be ... always abounding in the work of the Lord, because you know that your labor is not in vain in the Lord.

Others say strive hard to get faith for sanctification, and then you'll receive sanctification that will then let you work effortlessly.

Wesley. Let me gain that second rest; from my works for ever cease (p. 33). We receive it [sanctification rest] by simple faith: But God does not, will not, give that faith, unless we seek it with all diligence, ... in vigorous, universal obedience, in a zealous keeping of all the commandments, in watchfulness and painfulness, in denying ourselves, and taking

up our cross daily; as well as in earnest prayer and fasting. (p. 45).

But Paul says not to put our efforts indirectly into getting faith that will then give us effortless sanctification, but to put our efforts directly into sanctification and service.

2 Tim. 2:3-6. Endure hardness as a good soldier of Jesus Messiah. No man that wars [and we do war] entangles himself with the affairs of this life. ... And if a man also strive for masteries [and we do strive for mastery], yet he is not crowned, unless he strives lawfully. The husbandman that labors must be first partaker of the fruits.

1 Cor. 9:19-27. I made myself servant to all, ... that I might by all means save some. And this I do for the gospel's sake. ... So run, that you may obtain. And every man that strives for the mastery is temperate in all things. Now they do it to obtain a corruptible crown; but we an incorruptible. I therefore so run, not as uncertainly; so fight I, not as one that beats the air: but I keep under my body, and bring it into subjection.

We receive the promise of justification by faith, and the promise of glorification by endurance, but after justification, we are to imitate the good works of others by diligent labor.

Heb. 6:8-18. That which bears thorns and briars is rejected, ... whose end is to be burned. But, beloved, we are persuaded better things of you, and things that accompany salvation. ... For God is not unrighteous to forget YOUR WORK AND LABOR of love, ... in that YOU

HAVE MINISTERED to the saints, and do minister. And we desire that every one of you do show the same DILIGENCE to the full assurance of hope to the end, that you BE NOT SLOTHFUL, but followers of them who through faith and patience inherit the promises. For when God made promise to Abraham, after he had patiently endured, he obtained the promise.

The false doctrine of sanctification by faith rather than by works, is in harmony with mysticism, charismaticism, asceticism, meditation and contemplation, devotionalism, direct revelation, emotion over reason, esotericism, experience over the Word, hesychasm, higher life, living union, monasticism, non-literal interpretation of scripture, perfect love, pietism, power with God, quietism, second blessing, spirituality which isn't truly spiritual, theosis, theosophy, the victorious life, etc. It is in opposition to the truly spiritual, but boring literal interpretation of the scriptures, the new mind guiding the emotions, etc.

100-1650. Early Movements

135 AD. Montanists

It's not surprising, that after the charismatic gifts died out, some, like the Montanists around 135 AD, tried to imitate them. Montanus' 'New Prophecy' proclaimed some towns in Asia Minor as the 'New Jerusalem.' He had two female colleagues, Prisca ... and Maximilla, who likewise claimed direct revelation. "The Three' spoke in ecstatic visions and urged their followers to fast and to pray, so that they might share these revelations."

370-1340 AD. Euchites, Free Spirits, Friends of God

From the 2nd to 12th centuries, a group called the Euchites, believed perfection could be obtained through prayer. In the 13th to 15th centuries, the Brethren of the Free Spirit, believed in perfectionism, antinomianism, oneness with God through annihilation of the soul, and direct revelation through the Holy Spirit. Around 1340, a center of German mysticism called the Friends of God was founded based on the influence of mystic Meister Eckhart.

1526-1534. Tyndale's New Testament and the Anglican Church

Wycliffe translated the Bible into English in 1382. The printing press was invented in 1439. After Luther was condemned by the Catholic Church at the Diet of Worms in 1521, Prince Frederick III protected him from the Pope and the Holy Roman Emperor, King Charles V.. William Tyndale's English New Testament, published in 1526, was the first English Bible to be mass produced, and included an epilogue explaining Luther's theology of justification by faith. Luther finished his translation of the Bible into German in 1534. That same year the Anglican Church was established in England. The combination of everyone being able to read the scriptures for themselves (a good thing in itself), and the existence of some safe places from Roman Catholic violent persecution (also a good thing in itself), opened the door for every imaginable kind of biblical interpretation and cult creation.

1650. English Dissenters

When the English Commonwealth was established in 1649, besides Catholics, Anglicans, Anabaptists, Baptists, Congregationalists, Presbyterians, Puritans, Quakers, and Unitarians; many other groups arose.

Behmenists. Based on the teachings of German mystic and theosopher Jakob Böhme who claimed divine revelation.

Brownists. The Plymouth Mayflower Pilgrims.

Diggers. Tried to share community farmland like the early brethren shared property in Jerusalem.

Enthusiasts. Originally meant ‘possessed by a god’ and related to direct revelation, ecstasy, and emotion.

Familists. Followers of a Dutch mystic named Hendrik Niclaes, supposedly the only person who knew how to achieve a state of perfection.

Fifth Monarchists. Believed the Kingdom of God would be set up in 1666.

Grindletonians. Antinomians who believed a true brother with the Spirit within him doesn’t sin and is above law. They were influenced by the 14th century mystical treatise *Theologia Germanica*.

Muggletonians. Started by two London tailors who announced they were the last prophets foretold in the book of Revelation.

Philadelphians. Led by the mystic John Pordage, and Jane Leade, who had visions of the Feminine Aspect of God. They believed the Holy Spirit exists in every person’s soul.

Ranters. Antinomians whose central idea was pantheistic, that God is in every creature, and

men should hearken to Jesus within them. Seekers. They held meetings in silence, waiting on direct inspiration and guidance.¹

It's not surprising, that as men began to read the Bible for themselves, and had more freedom to talk about it, they tried to reproduce the miraculous manifestations of the Spirit, and the direct revelation of the prophets and apostles they read about in the Bible, without regard to scriptural context. Adam ate only vegetables, Noah ate all meats, Moses ate no pork; but they wanted to be Adam, Noah, and Moses.

1650-1685. Let Go and Let God

1650. George Fox (Quaker), The Light Within

Fox. [The primacy of the Spirit, the light within, over the Bible, the light without:] Now the Lord God opened to me [via direct revelation within] ... that every man was enlightened [within] by the divine Light of Christ, ... and that they that believed in it came out of condemnation [and into] the Light [i.e., a new way of salvation without the gospel]. ... This I saw in the pure openings of the Light without the help of any man; neither did I then know where to find it in the Scriptures; though afterwards, searching the Scriptures, I found it. For I saw, in that Light and Spirit which was before the Scriptures were given forth, ... that all, if they would know God or Christ, or the Scriptures aright, must come to that Spirit by which they that gave [the scriptures] forth

¹ Wikipedia, English Dissenters.

were led and taught [meaning we can receive revelation equal to, and often greater than, scripture]. ... Yet I had no slight esteem of the holy Scriptures [which are secondary].²

1650, Fox (Quaker), Perfectionism. I was come up in spirit ... into the paradise of God. All things were new. ... I knew nothing but pureness, and innocency, and righteousness; being renewed into the image of God by Christ Jesus, to the state of Adam, which he was in before he fell [sinless perfection that can fall]. ... But I was immediately taken up in spirit to see into another [even higher] or more steadfast state than Adam's innocency, even into a state in Christ Jesus that should never fall [sinless perfection that can't fall]. And the Lord showed me that such as were faithful to Him [if you're already faithful, why do you need to be given sinless perfection?], in the power and light of Christ, should come up into that state in which Adam was before he fell. ... [Let Go] As people come into subjection to the Spirit of God, [Let God] and grow up in the image and power of the Almighty, [Result] they ... come to know the hidden unity in the Eternal Being [union with God].³ [Regarding some men who came to see him:] I had a sense, before they spoke, that they came to [argue] for sin and imperfection. ... [Prerequisite] If your faith be true, [Result] it will give you victory over sin and the devil. ... But they could not endure to hear of purity, and of victory over sin and the devil. They said they could not believe any could be free from sin on this side of the grave.⁴

² Fox, *Autobiography*, Kindle 828-43.

³ *Ibid*, Kindle 788-799.

⁴ *Ibid*, Kindle, 1031-1037.

1678. Barclay (Quaker). Apology for True Christian Divinity

1678. Barclay. *An Apology for the True Christian Divinity.* PROPOSITION VIII. Concerning Perfection. In whom this pure and holy birth is fully brought forth [vs. only partially born-again?], the body of death and sin comes to be crucified and removed, and their hearts united and subjected to the truth; so as not to obey any suggestions or temptations of the evil one, but to be free from actual sinning and transgressing of the law of God, and in that respect perfect (Kindle 6540). ... Though I affirm, that after a man hath arrived at such a state, in which he may be able not to sin, yet he may sin [sinless perfection that can fall]: nevertheless, I will not affirm that a state is not attainable in this life, in which to do righteousness may be so natural to the regenerate soul, that in the stability of that condition he cannot sin (Kindle 6575). ... I have not yet attained it (Kindle 6578-6581).⁵

1680. Marshall (Puritan). The Gospel Mystery of Sanctification

1680. Marshall. *The Gospel Mystery of Sanctification.* Our apprehension of Christ and His perfections in this life is only by faith, ... and this faith is imperfect. ... Therefore, though we receive a perfect Christ by faith, yet the measure and degree of enjoying Him is imperfect (p. 191). ... In the person of Christ ... the old man is perfectly crucified. ... And believers do in their own persons receive and enjoy by faith all these perfect spiritual blessings of Christ, as far as they receive and

⁵ Barclay, Works, Kindle 6578-6581.

enjoy Christ Himself dwelling in them, and no farther (p. 195). ... Our way to mortify sinful affections and lusts must be, not by purging them out of the flesh, but by putting off the flesh itself and getting above into Christ by faith, and walking in that new nature that is by Him (p. 199). ... We have need to strive for more faith, that we may receive Christ in greater perfection (p. 184). ... [Let Go] We are not sanctified by any of our own endeavors to work holiness in ourselves, [Let God] but rather by faith in Christ's death and resurrection, even the same whereby we are justified. (p. 259).

1685-1700. Roman Catholic Mystics

Many Roman Catholic mystics in the years after Fox also called for surrender to Christ.

1685. Madame Guyon

Despite Guyon's use of some Bible vocabulary, like the other Roman Catholic mystics, I couldn't find any indication she or they ever believed on the Lord for justification. Her use of the word 'faith' doesn't seem to refer to faith in God's word, or justification by faith. She always promoted the inward life. Her version of a salvation experience, like that of George Fox, seems to have been to look at the spark within.

Guyon, Autobiography. I did not hesitate ... to tell him ... my difficulties about prayer. Presently he replied, "It is, madame, because you seek without what you have within. Accustom yourself to seek God in your heart, and you will there find Him." ... O my Lord, Thou wast in my heart, and demanded only a

simple turning of my mind inward, to make me perceive Thy presence. ... It was for want of understanding these words of Thy Gospel, ... “The kingdom of God is within you.” This I now experienced. ... I told this man, that I did not know what he had done to me, that my heart was quite changed, that God was there. He had given me an experience of His presence in my soul; not by thought or any application of mind.⁶ ... [Years Later:] In the midst of my miseries, Geneva came into my mind ... which caused me many fears. “What,” said I, “to complete my reprobation, shall I go to such an excess of impiety, as to quit the [Roman Catholic] faith through apostasy? (The inhabitants of Geneva being generally Protestant Calvinists.) Am I then about quitting that church, for which I would give a thousand lives? ... I had such a distrust of myself.⁷

1685. Miguel de Molinos

Also, I can't find any reason to suspect Molinos was ever justified by faith. He taught Quietism vs. Roman Catholicism, not Luther's justification by faith vs. Roman Catholicism.

Bigelow. There is nothing in these doctrines of passivity which had not been taught by many of the most highly esteemed mystical writers of the [Roman Catholic] Church, by St. Bonaventura, St. Theresa, John of the Cross, the Baroness de Chantal, St. Francis de Sales,

⁶ Guyon, *Autobiography*, Kindle 658-670.

⁷ *Ibid.*, Kindle 1762-1765.

and others, some of whom indeed had been canonized as saints.⁸

Molinos was thoroughly examined by the inquisition, who confiscated his voluminous private writings and letters, and they would have charged him with believing in justification by faith alone, if there were any hint of it in him. His non-conformity was of a different kind.

Bigelow. While his disciples became usually more strict in their manner of life, ... they showed a corresponding indifference to the exterior rites of the church; they were seen less frequently at mass, made little account of corporeal austerities, chaplets, and relics, neglected the confessional and pilgrimages, and were growing less lavish in their expenditures for masses for their deceased friends and kindred. ... Quietism or Romanism must go to the wall; ... there was not room in Europe for both.⁹

Molinos taught ...

Molinos. Look at nothing, desire nothing, will nothing, ... endeavour nothing; and then, in everything, thy soul will live reposed with quiet and enjoyment. This, this is the way to get purity of soul, perfect contemplation, and peace internal.¹⁰

What scripture does he quote for that? One critic at the time wrote a sarcastic Quietist version of the Lord's Prayer. First the genuine ...

⁸ Bigelow, Molinos the Quietist, 9-10.

⁹ Bigelow, Molinos the Quietist, 17-18.

¹⁰ Molinos, Spiritual Guide, Kindle 1696-1701.

Mt. 6:9-13. KJV. [Jesus said,] “After this manner therefore pray: Our Father which is in heaven, hallowed be your name. Your kingdom come, your will be done, in earth as it is in heaven. Give us this day our daily bread. And forgive us our debts, as we forgive our debtors. And lead us not into temptation, but deliver us from evil. For yours is the kingdom, and the power, and the glory, for ever.”

Then the Quietist version ...

Mt. 6:9-13. La Bruyere Quietist Version (1699). Finally, my God, I am too entirely abandoned to Your will to ask You to deliver me from temptations and from evil. - O God, who art no more in Heaven than on Earth or in Hell, who art everywhere, I neither wish nor desire your name to be sanctified. You know what is suitable for us, and if You wish it to be, it will be without my wishing or desiring it; whether Your Kingdom comes or not is to me indifferent. Neither do I ask that Your will be done on Earth as it is done in Heaven. It will be done in spite of my wishes, and it is for me to be resigned. Give us all our daily bread which is Your grace, or do not give it; I neither desire to have it or to be deprived of it. So if You pardon my crimes as I have pardoned those who have wronged me, so much the better. If, on the other hand, You punish me by damnation, still so much the better, since such is Your will.¹¹

¹¹ Dialogues Posthumes du Sieur de la Bruyere sur le Quietisme, 193; quoted in Bigelow, Molinos the Quietist, 9-10.

1699. Francois Fenelon

Likewise, Fenelon was unregenerate. He had no more knowledge of God and truth, than darkness has of light. Why would any believer try to learn spiritual truth from unbelievers? The Peace of Augsburg of 1555 established the principle “whose realm, his religion” which allowed rulers within the Holy Roman Empire to choose Lutheranism or Catholicism for their country and allowed citizens to emigrate to other regions if they didn’t want to convert to their prince’s religion. Louis XIV of France persecuted the minority Protestant Huguenot population in France and wouldn’t let them emigrate. He claimed he reduced the French Huguenot population from about 800,000 to about 1,000. One of the main men he used to accomplish this was Fenelon.

For some time Fenelon was in charge of the community of “New Catholics” in Paris, which was presented as ‘protecting women and children who wanted to convert’ from their Protestant husbands and fathers, but which actually meant incarcerating and indoctrinating them as a means of coercing both the husbands and their families to convert.

Archives. January 24, 1686. The king knows that the wife of the man Trouillard, apothecary at Paris, ... is one of the most stubborn Huguenots in existence. And, as her conversion may bring about that of her husband, his majesty desires that you have her arrested and taken to the Nouvelles Catholiques. ...The eldest [Marguerite] Hammonnet is very obstinate. She is only four years old, and yet it is very dangerous to give

her the liberty to see those who are not yet converted, or are bad Catholics.¹²

A French book not yet translated into English exposes some of the atrocities of “La Maison des Nouvelles Catholiques” (Emmanuel Orentin Douen, *L’Intolérance de Fénelon*, 1872), though the work has been summarized in English in *The Christian Quarterly* (Volume V, January – October, 1873).¹³

Fenelon was falsely presented in history as the gentlest and sweetest of men. But actually, ...

Fenelon. The badly converted Huguenots are attached to their religion to the most horrible excesses of stubbornness; but as soon as the rigor of punishments appears, all their strength leaves them.¹⁴

Kauffman. Of Madame Guyon - his former intimate friend, who was, ... confined in the Bastille ... [he] said: “I am willing that she shall die there, that we shall never see her again, and that we shall never hear any one speak of her again.” And elsewhere he says of her: “If it is true that this woman wanted to establish this damnable system [Molinism], she ought to be burned instead of giving her the communion.” ... [Also,] “The Church must be ready to punish, in the most exemplary manner, all disobedience of indocile spirits. ... Nothing would be more cruel than a cowardly compassion which would tolerate the contagion in the whole flock. ... We must employ, says Saint Augustine, a medicinal rigor, a terrible tenderness, and a severe

¹² Kauffman, *L’intolérance De Fénelon*.

¹³ *Ibid.*

¹⁴ *Ibid.*

charity. ... He was never weary of lauding the “douceur,” the “gentleness, and good-will” of Louis XIV toward his Huguenot subjects [who killed most of them off]. ... Fénelon ... as St. Simon, his biographer, says, “insisted on being oracle; on ruling as master, without giving a reason to any body; on reigning directly.”¹⁵

Gene Edwards on Guyon, Molinos, & Fenelon

In the table below, I address the mysticism of these three as they’re enthusiastically promoted by a modern mystic, well-known within the house church movement, Gene Edwards, in his book, *100 Days in the Secret Place*. Would a born-again person try to learn spiritual things from natural men who can’t understand spiritual things?

Edwards. Between the writings of Guyon and Fenelon you will find the richest spiritual treasures afforded to you today. ... Since then no voices have arisen to take believers to the heights of spiritual riches, as have they.¹⁶

Really? Unregenerate unbelievers at enmity with God take believers to the heights of spiritual riches?!? Which spirit’s spiritual riches? Who did Guyon meet with when she turned inward, since Jesus wasn’t there, since she wasn’t justified by faith? Probably the same person born-again believers meet when they turn inward: themselves.

God created man’s body, soul, and spirit with great ability to talk to ourselves, and creatively imagine all kinds of things. “Sin not. Commune with your own

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ Edwards, *Secret Place*, Kindle 219-226.

heart upon your bed, and be still,” Psalm 4:4. Christ does “dwell in your hearts” (Eph. 3:17), but there’s no way to ‘meet him there.’

Emptying one’s mind is simply pagan, no-thought, Hindu and Buddhist meditation; and ‘annihilation’ is simply pagan pantheism. They have nothing to do with New Testament teaching. Notice the paucity of scripture references in the writings of Guyon, Molinos, and Fenelon. Their advice comes from their own creative minds, and their tone is quite different from the Bible. The page numbers are from *100 Days in the Secret Place*.

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - SALVATION AND EDIFICATION

<p><u>Guyon</u>. The way to reach <u>the lost</u> is to reach them <u>by the heart</u> [not the words of the gospel]. ...</p>	<p><u>Rom. 1:16</u>. The gospel of Messiah ... is the power of God to salvation to everyone that believes. <u>Rom. 10:14-17</u>. How shall they hear, without ... them that preach the gospel? ... Faith comes by hearing, and hearing by the word of God. <u>Acts 18:4</u>. He <u>reasoned</u> in the synagogue every sabbath, and <u>persuaded</u>.</p>
<p>... The <u>new Christian</u> should be led to God. How! By learning to <u>turn within to Jesus Christ</u> and by giving the Lord his whole heart. ... Lead them to a real <u>inner knowledge</u> [vs. scripture knowledge] of Jesus. [37-8]</p>	<p><u>Rm. 16:25-27</u>. [God] is of power to <u>establish you according to my gospel</u>, and the <u>preaching</u> of Jesus Messiah, ... and by the <u>scriptures</u> of the prophets. <u>1 Ths. 2:9-13</u>. Laboring night and day, ... we <u>preached</u> to you the <u>gospel</u> of God. ... We <u>thank</u> God without ceasing, because, when you <u>received</u> the <u>word</u> of God which you <u>heard</u> of us, you received it not as the <u>word</u> of men, but as ... the <u>word</u> of God, which <u>effectually works</u> also in you that <u>believe</u>.</p>

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - UNION WITH GOD

<p><u>Guyon</u>. We come now to the <u>ultimate</u> state of Christian experience. <u>Divine Union</u>. All that comes from your life - even your most exalted prayer - must first be <u>destroyed</u> before union can come about. [39]</p>	<p><u>Jn. 14:16-20</u>. The Father ... <u>will</u> give you another Comforter [at Pentecost], so that he will abide with you for ever, even the Spirit. ... He dwells <u>with</u> you, and <u>will be in</u> you. ... At that day [Pentecost] you will know that <u>I am in my Father</u>, and <u>you in me</u>, and <u>I in you</u>. <u>1 Jn. 1:3</u>. Truly our <u>union</u> is [already] with the Father and ... Son.</p>
--	--

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - BECOMING LIKE JESUS

Molinos. When you come before the Lord, it is not necessary that you think upon the Lord. ... The simpler your remembrance is - without words or thoughts - the better foundation you lay for an undistorted relationship with the Lord who abides in you. [21] ... To lay hold of the silence of thought is to arrive and abide at the center of your being, where Christ dwells.

Heb. 8:10. I will put my laws in their mind. 1 Tim. 4:13-15. Give attendance to reading, to exhortation, to doctrine. ... Meditate on these things; give yourself wholly to them. 1 Pet. 1:13. Gird up the loins of your mind. Col. 3:1. Since you then are risen with Messiah, seek those things which are above, where Messiah sits on the right hand of God. ... Let the word of Messiah dwell in you richly in all wisdom.

By not speaking, desiring, nor reasoning, we reach the central place of the inward walk - that place where God speaks to our inward man. ... It is in that place that He transforms you into Himself. [67]

Rom. 12:2-3. Be transformed by the renewing of your mind. ... For I say ... to every man, ... not to think of himself more highly than he ought to think, but to think soberly. Phil. 2:2-8. Be ... of one mind. ... In lowliness of mind let each esteem other better than themselves. ... Let this mind be in you, which was also in Messiah Jesus.

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - HOW TO PRAY

Guyon. All the prayers that proceed from your mind, ... all active contemplation on your part is ... just preparation for bringing you to a passive state. [39]

Molinos. There is a view of your Lord in which reason, meditation and thought do not play a large part. In the first kind of prayer, one thinks upon God; in the other, one beholds Him. The second is a purer practice. ... Rational prayer is but a method to bring you to a deeper, more tranquil relationship with your Lord. When you have arrived at this second level of prayer you put an end to all rational discussion; instead, you rest. A simple vision of God. [56-7]

Lu. 11:2. When you pray, say, "Our Father." Mt. 26:44. [Jesus] ... prayed the third time, saying the same words. 1 Ths. 1:2-3. We give thanks to God always for you all, making mention of you in our prayers, remembering without ceasing your work of faith, and labor of love. Mt. 26:41. Watch and pray, that you enter not into temptation. Mk. 13:33. Take heed, watch and pray. Lu. 21:36. Watch therefore, and pray always. Col. 4:2. Continue in prayer, and watch in the same with thanksgiving. Col. 4:11-13. Epaphras, ... [is] a servant of Messiah, ... always laboring fervently for you in prayers, that you may stand perfect. ... He has a great zeal for you!

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - DO NOTHING OR WORK HARD? (1)	
<p><u>Guyon.</u> One of the most important things you can do is [Let Go] <u>cease from any self-effort.</u> In this way, [Let God] God Himself can <u>act alone.</u></p>	<p><u>Lu. 10:27.</u> Love the Lord your God with all <u>your heart</u>, and with all <u>your soul</u>, and with all <u>your strength</u>, and with all <u>your mind.</u> <u>Rev. 2:2.</u> I know <u>your works</u>, and <u>your labor.</u> <u>Heb. 6:9-10.</u> God is not unrighteous to forget <u>your work</u> and <u>labor</u> of love, ... <u>you have ministered</u> to the saints, and do <u>minister.</u> And we desire that every one of you do show the same <u>diligence.</u> <u>Phil. 2:12-13.</u> <u>Work out</u> your own salvation, ... for it is God which works in you. <u>Jas. 4:7.</u> Resist the devil. ... Cleanse your hands.</p>
<p>God's working within you is ... within the realm of the spirit, and not in the <u>mind.</u> [136-7]</p>	<p><u>Col. 1:5-6; 3:16.</u> The <u>word</u> of the <u>truth</u> of the <u>gospel</u>, ... brings forth fruit ... in you, since the day you <u>heard</u> of it, and <u>knew</u> the grace of God in <u>truth.</u> ... Let the <u>word</u> of Messiah dwell in you richly in all <u>wisdom.</u></p>
<p><u>Molinos.</u> Those who are spiritual <u>externally</u> seek God by <u>reasoning.</u></p>	<p><u>Col. 3:10.</u> <u>Put on</u> the new man, which is renewed in <u>knowledge.</u> <u>2 Tim. 3:14-17.</u> <u>Continue</u> in the things which you have <u>learned.</u> ... From a child you have <u>known</u> the holy <u>scriptures</u>, which are able to make you <u>wise</u> to salvation through faith. ... All <u>scripture</u> is given by inspiration of God, and is profitable for <u>doctrine</u>, for reproof, for correction, for <u>instruction</u> in righteousness, so that the man of God may be <u>perfect</u>, thoroughly furnished to all good works.</p>
<p>These [external] people <u>endure pain</u> to obtain <u>virtue.</u></p>	<p><u>2 Tim. 2:3.</u> <u>Endure hardness</u>, as a good soldier of Jesus Messiah.</p>

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - DO NOTHING OR WORK HARD? (2)

<p>They delight in <u>talking</u> about God.</p>	<p><u>Heb. 10:26.</u> Consider one another to <u>provoke</u> to love and to good works, ... <u>exhorting</u> one another. <u>Titus 3:1-14.</u> Put them in <u>mind</u> to be ... ready to every good work. ... <u>Affirm constantly</u>, that they which have believed in God ... be <u>careful</u> to maintain good works. These things are good and profitable to men. ... <u>Learn</u> to maintain good works. <u>2 Tim. 2:14-16.</u> Put them in <u>remembrance</u> of these things. <u>1 Ths. 4:18.</u> Comfort one another with these <u>words</u>. <u>Heb. 3:13.</u> <u>Exhort</u> one another daily.</p>
--	--

<p>They delight in being very <u>fervent</u> in <u>love</u>.</p>	<p><u>1 Pet. 1:22.</u> <u>Love</u> one another ... <u>fervently</u>. <u>1 Pet. 4:8.</u> Above all things have <u>fervent love</u> among yourselves. <u>Jn. 13:35.</u> By this shall all men know that you are my disciples, if ye have love one to another. <u>1 Cor. 13:13.</u> The greatest of these is love.</p>
--	---

<p>The ones who ... walk toward the inner way ... <u>withdraw</u> into the <u>inward</u> parts of their spirits</p>	<p><u>Phil. 4:1.</u> True <u>yokefellow</u>, <u>help</u> those ... which <u>labored</u> with me in the gospel, ... and with other my <u>fellow laborers</u>.</p>
---	--

and there relinquish everything about themselves. And not only things, but themselves! [68-9] Only the believer who knows how to be detached attains to being lost in God. ... Some people ... do not attain to an experiential knowledge of Divine encounter ... because they do not give themselves totally to God with a perfect divesting of interest in themselves. [122-3]

Phil. 2:3-5. Look not every man on his own things, but ... also on the things of others. Let this mind be in you, which was also in Messiah Jesus. 1 Tim. 4:13-16. Meditate on these things. Give yourself wholly to them, that your profiting may appear to all. Take heed to yourself, and to the doctrine; continue in them. Col. 3:17, 23. Do all ... heartily as to the Lord. Titus 2:14. A peculiar people, zealous of good works. 1 Cor. 15:10. [Paul] labored more abundantly than they all.

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - OVERCOMING SIN (1)

Guyon. The only way to conquer your five senses is by turning your soul completely inward to your spirit. ... When your soul is turned within, it actually becomes ... farther and farther separated from the self [where's the self if not within?]. ... The outer man becomes very weak. (Some may even be prone to faintings.) ... Your main concern lies in dwelling continually upon the God who is within you. ... The Christian who has faithfully [Let Go] abandoned himself to the Lord will soon discover that ... [Let God] your Lord will put to death all that remains to be put to death in your life. ... Everyone is capable of turning within and abandoning himself wholly to God. [79-80]

Fenelon. [Let Go] Surrender yourself to God and learn to [Let God] live by Him rather than out of your own strength. ... Cling to God, within you, and there you will find deep and true fellowship [actually you're clinging to yourself]. [105-6]

1 Cor. 16:13. Watch, stand fast in the faith, quit you like men, be strong. Eph. 6:11-18. Be strong. ... Put on the whole armor of God, ... that you may be able to withstand in the evil day, and having done all, to stand. Stand therefore, having your loins girded about with truth [scripture]. ... Praying always. Rom. 13:12-13. Let us ... cast off the works of darkness, and let us put on the armor of light. Eph. 4:22-23. Put off concerning the former behavior the old man, ... according to the deceitful lusts, and be renewed in the spirit of your mind. Col. 3:2-16. Put off the old man with his deeds, and ... put on the new man, which is renewed in knowledge. ... Put on ... bowels of mercies. ... Put on love. ... Let the word of Messiah dwell in you richly in all wisdom.

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - OVERCOMING SIN (2)

<p><u>Molinos</u>. Come by <u>faith</u>. ... Those who seek the Lord <u>externally</u> have to always <u>do</u> something ... outward mortification, <u>efforts</u> at destroying certain weaknesses, <u>battles</u> with desires, or the acquiring of spiritual <u>knowledge</u>.</p>	<p><u>1 Cor. 9:24-27</u>. <u>Run</u>, that you may obtain. And every man that <u>strives</u> for the mastery is <u>temperate</u> in all things. ... So <u>fight</u> I, not as one that beats the air, but I keep under my body, and bring it into subjection. <u>Rom. 6:11</u>. <u>Reckon</u> [which requires thinking]... yourselves to be dead indeed to sin, but alive to God.</p>
--	---

<p>The inward way is a <u>centering</u> of the whole being in a loving manner in the Divine presence. ... It is by Him that virtue is established; ... that <u>desires</u> are <u>eradicated</u>; ... imperfections are destroyed.</p>	<p><u>Heb. 12:1-4</u>. Let <u>us lay aside</u> every weight, and the sin which does so easily beset us, and let <u>us run</u> with patience the race that is set before us, looking to Jesus, ... who for the joy that was set before him <u>endured</u> the cross, ... for <u>consider</u> him that <u>endured</u>, ... lest you be wearied and faint in your <u>minds</u>. You have not yet <u>resisted</u> unto blood, <u>striving</u> against sin.</p>
--	--

<p>He lives in spirit <u>without</u> those great <u>efforts</u> of <u>struggling</u>. He finds himself free. [68-9]</p>	<p><u>1 Tim. 6:12</u>. <u>Fight</u> the good <u>fight</u> of faith. <u>2 Tim. 4:7</u>. I have <u>fought</u> a good <u>fight</u>, I have finished my course.</p>
---	---

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - ANNIHILATION OR INTENTIONAL THINKING?

Guyon. You must cease to exist in self so that the Spirit of the Eternal Word may exist in you. By the giving up of your own life, you make way for His. ... You must surrender your whole being to Jesus Christ. ... The annihilation of self is the true prayer of worship! ... To be “in spirit,” the soul is annihilated. [89-90]

Eph. 3:14-16. I bow my knees to the Father, ... that he would grant you ... to be strengthened with might by his Spirit in the inner man. Phil. 1:27. Stand fast in one spirit, with one mind striving together for the faith of the gospel. Col. 3:16-23. Let the word of Messiah dwell in you richly in all wisdom; teaching and admonishing one another in psalms and hymns and spiritual songs, singing with grace in your hearts to the Lord.

Guyon. Feel the Lord gradually taking possession of your whole being.

2 Ths. 2:15. Brethren, stand fast, and hold the traditions.

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - BE DETACHED OR INVOLVED?	
<p><u>Molinos</u>. The men or women who would attain to that deeper walk with their Lord must <u>abandon</u> and be detached from these four things: Creatures [like teachers,</p>	<p><u>2 Tim. 2:2</u>. The things that you have heard of me among many witnesses, the same <u>commit</u> to faithful men, who will be able to <u>teach others</u> also.</p>
<p>friends,</p>	<p><u>Phil. 4:1</u>. My <u>brethren</u> dearly beloved and longed for, my joy and crown, so stand fast in the Lord, my dearly beloved. <u>1 Ths. 3:7-9</u>. Now we live, if you stand fast in the Lord. For what thanks can we render to God again for you, for all the joy wherewith we joy for your sakes before our God.</p>
<p>and family], Temporal things,</p>	<p><u>1 Tim. 5:8</u>. If any provide not for <u>his own</u>, and especially for those of <u>his own house</u>, he has denied the faith, and is worse than an infidel.</p>
<p>The very gifts of the Holy Spirit, Self. [122-3]</p>	<p><u>1 Tim. 4:14</u>. Neglect not the <u>gift</u> that is in you.</p>

MYSTICISM VS THE WORD - UNSEEN REALMS OR THE WORD?	
<p><u>Molinos</u>. Men who seek after God by ... acquiring information about the <u>Scriptures</u> are really nothing more than scholars. They do not know the <u>unseen realms</u>, nor do they realize that <u>hidden</u> things of God are found only within the spirit, ... <u>that place</u> where God keeps His throne and communicates Himself to the one who comes and joins Him in <u>that place</u>. Unbelievably, there are even some who <u>condemn</u> such a concept. [121-2]</p>	<p><u>Col. 3:16-23</u>. Let the <u>word</u> of Messiah dwell in you richly in all <u>wisdom</u>; <u>teaching</u> and <u>admonishing</u> one another, ... <u>singing</u> with grace <u>in your hearts</u> to the Lord. <u>2 Tim. 2:14-16</u>. <u>Study</u> to show yourself approved to God, a <u>workman</u> that needs not to be ashamed, rightly dividing the <u>word</u> of truth. <u>Phil. 4:8</u>. Whatever things are true, ... honest, ... just, ... pure, ... lovely, [etc.] ... <u>think</u> on these things.</p>

The following is a summary of various “Let Go and Let God” movements that followed the years of George Fox and the Roman Catholic mystics.

1766-1858. The Sinless Perfection Movement

1734-1748. The First Great Awakening

John Wesley in Britain, and Jonathan Edwards and George Whitfield in America, were the main figures in the First Great Awakening. Some physical phenomena like bodily fits were experienced by people during these revivals. However, then most people considered such physical phenomena to be the neutral result, in emotionally susceptible people, of the Holy Spirit's work on people's rational thinking; whereas now most people think the Holy Spirit is actually directly causing those inherently valueless, bodily phenomena, like tongues and fits.

1740. Jonathan Edwards. It is easily accounted for ... by the laws of the union between soul and body, how a ... true and proper sense of things, should have such effects on the body. ... The misery of hell is doubtless so dreadful, and eternity so vast, that if a person should have a clear apprehension of that misery as it is, it would be more that his feeble frame could bear. ... Some would have it, that [some ministers] speak of these things as certain evidences of a work of the Spirit of God on the hearts of their hearers, or that they esteem these bodily effects themselves to be the work of God, as though the Spirit of God took hold of and agitated the bodies of men; and some are charged with making these things essential, and supposing that persons cannot be converted without them; whereas I never yet could see the person that held either of these things. But for speaking of such effects as probable tokens of God's presence, and

arguments of the success of preaching [reaching the minds of men and thereby affecting the emotions], ... I think they are so indeed.¹⁷

Tracy. Towards the close of the Great Awakening of 1740, these “manifestations” began to assume the character of an epidemic; though by no means so clearly as in the “Kentucky [1801 Cane Ridge] revival.” John [Wesley] received and valued them as proofs of the divine presence, and they increased under his labors. Charles [Wesley] discouraged them. ... Whitefield was incredulous; and when at last some, who had been John Wesley’s hearers, fell down under Whitefield’s preaching [in Pennsylvania and New Jersey in 1740], Wesley thanked God for it, thinking that Whitefield would then be convinced, ... [but Whitefield] ascribed them to diabolic influence. “Satan now begins to throw many into fits.” ... They never ascribed these bodily agitations to divine influence directly, as was slanderously reported; but to those convictions, hopes, and fears, which divine influence had imparted, and which produced the same effects as equally violent feelings concerning worldly things [like the death of a family member] might have done. ... But after all, the lenity with which these “manifestations” were treated ... was too great, and the ignorant took occasion to consider them as parts of the revival, – of that process by which their souls were to be saved. A more decided discouragement of them would have saved a vast amount of evil.¹⁸

¹⁷ Edwards, *Thoughts Concerning the Present Revival*, 1493-2413.

¹⁸ Tracy, *Great Awakening*, 249-252.

One reason Edwards couldn't be very enthusiastic about discouraging bodily effects at revival meetings, is that not only he himself could hardly move sometimes from thinking about some aspect of God's glory, but also ...

Tracy. In 1723, when he was about twenty years of age, he wrote on a blank leaf of some book: "They say there is a young lady in --, who is beloved of that Great Being. ... She hardly cares for anything, except to meditate on him. ... Therefore, if you present all the world before her, with the richest of its treasures, she disregards it and cares not for it, and is unmindful of any pain or affliction. ... She will sometimes go about from place to place, singing sweetly. ... She loves to be alone, walking in the fields and groves, and seems to have someone invisible always conversing with her." This young lady was Sarah Pierrepont, and about four years after this was written, she became his wife. Mrs. Edwards continued to enjoy, after her marriage, those occasional visits of the "Great Being." ... Of their "very great effects on the body," Edwards mentions, "nature often sinking under the weight of divine discoveries, the strength of the body being taken away, so as to deprive of all ability to stand or speak; sometimes the hands clenched, and the flesh cold, but the senses still remaining."¹⁹

1766. Wesley. Plain Account of Christian Perfection

Naselli. John Wesley (1703–1791) is the father of views that chronologically separate the time a person becomes a Christian from the time

¹⁹ Tracy, Great Awakening, 252-254.

sanctification begins. ... When Wesleyan perfectionism blended with American revivalism, the holiness movement emerged. ... Methodist perfectionism emphasized the crisis of Christian perfection. ... The person most responsible for that was Phoebe Palmer (1807–1874). Her “altar theology” promised “a shorter way” to holiness. ... When you entirely consecrate yourself [on the altar], you are instantly and entirely sanctified, ... which she argued results in power for serving God.

Warfield. Writes Olin A. Curtis, “Wesley had almost the same epochal relation to the doctrinal emphasis upon holiness that Luther had to the doctrinal emphasis upon justification by faith.” ... As wave after wave of the “holiness movement” has broken over us during the past century, each has brought, no doubt, something distinctive of itself. But a common fundamental character ... has been communicated to them by the Wesleyan doctrine. ... In all of them alike justification and sanctification are divided from one another as two separate gifts of God. In all of them alike sanctification is represented as obtained, just like justification, by ... a new and separate act of faith, exercised for this specific purpose.²⁰

Whaling. A substantial part of John Wesley’s spiritual foundation was in mystical literature. “[John and Charles Wesley] had grown up in an atmosphere steeped in the great spiritual classics cherished by their parents. ... At Oxford, they had graduated to other spiritual classics [like those of] Jeremy Taylor, ... William Law, ... Kempis and other Roman

²⁰ Warfield, *Perfectionism*, Kindle 6912–21.

Catholic mystics. ... In 1730, with others in 'The Holy Club' [at Oxford University], they were exploring the fountain-head of Eastern-Orthodox spirituality - e.g., Clement of Alexandria, Macarius, the Cappadocians, Ephrem Syrus and others."²¹ In 1738, Wesley was counseled by Moravian, Peter Boehler; and on May 24, 1738, had his Aldersgate justification experience. Soon afterwards, he travelled to Herrnhut, Germany, to visit a Moravian community that had experienced a 'Second Pentecost' eleven years earlier. During his time at Herrnhut, "Wesley noted in his journal that he had encountered many living proofs of those who had been saved 'from inward as well as outward sin.'"²² "[Wesley's] two heroes were Ephraim Syrus and Macarius the Egyptian, ... [and also] Gregory of Nyssa through Macarius."²³ Of Macarius and Ephraim Syrus, he said in 1749, "I exceedingly reverence them as well as their writings."²⁴ "The fifty volumes of his Christian Library of 1750-1756 contained no works by Luther and Calvin but they did include the works of five French and three Spanish Roman Catholic mystics, namely, Pascal, Brother Lawrence, Fenelon, Mme Guyon, Mme Bourignon, John of Avila, Lopez, and Molinos."²⁵

1766, John Wesley, *A Plain Account of Christian Perfection*. [Victory] There is such a thing as perfection. ... It is 'perfect love.' ... Cleansed from all filthiness, ... to perfect holiness, ... a full deliverance from [the] carnal mind (p. 50). [Second Blessing] It is not so

²¹ Whaling, John and Charles Wesley, xiv.

²² Collins, John Wesley.

²³ Whaling, John and Charles Wesley, 12.

²⁴ Wesley, Letter to Middleton.

²⁵ Whaling, John and Charles Wesley, 10.

early as justification (p. 50). [Instantaneous] I believe this perfection is always wrought in the soul by a simple act of faith; consequently, in an instant. But I believe a gradual work ... preceding (p. 50). [Let Go] The absolute necessity ... to be all-devoted to God, to give him all my soul, my body, and my substance (p. 5). [Seek] Q. How are we to wait for this change? A. Not in careless indifference, or indolent inactivity; but in vigorous, universal obedience, in a zealous keeping of all the commandments, in watchfulness and painfulness, in denying ourselves, and taking up our cross daily; as well as in earnest prayer and fasting, ... [This is also the way] of keeping it when it is attained. ... We receive it by simple faith: But God does not, will not, give that faith, unless we seek it with all diligence, ... [which is] why so few have received the blessing. ... Prayer especially is wanting (p. 45). [Let God] Let me gain that second rest; from my works for ever cease (p. 33).

John Fletcher, a contemporary of Wesley, a theologian and interpreter of his teachings, identified the baptism of the Spirit with Wesley's post-justification, second-blessing, sanctification crisis experience.

1771. Fletcher. Last Check to Antinomianism

1771. Fletcher. *Last Check to Antinomianism.* Should you ask, how many baptisms, or effusions of the sanctifying Spirit are necessary to cleanse a believer from all sin, and to kindle his soul into perfect love; ... if one powerful baptism of the Spirit "seal you unto the day of redemption, and cleanse you from all [moral] filthiness," so much the better. If two or more

be necessary, the Lord can repeat them. ... And if one outpouring of the Spirit, one bright manifestation of the sanctifying truth, so empties us of self, as to fill us with the mind of Christ, and with pure love, we are undoubtedly Christians in the full sense of the word.²⁶

1775. Methodism in Virginia

Synan. The earliest stronghold for [Wesley's] Methodism in colonial America was in ... Virginia ... The Reverend Devereaux Jarratt, ... an Anglican, ... cooperated fully with the Methodist ... societies within his parish. ... Jarratt wrote, describing ... services of 1775, holiness religion was much in evidence. Many were “panting and groaning for pardon” while others were “entreating God, with strong cries and tears to save them from the remains of inbred sin, to sanctify them throughout.” ... Numbers of them testified to having been sanctified, “instantaneously, and by simple faith.” ... Jarratt observed ... that as the emotional element abated “the work of conviction and conversion abated too.” ... This revivalistic outbreak was one of the first instances of a Pentecostal-like religious revival in the nation, and was a direct antecedent of the frontier Kentucky revivals of 1800. ... Methodist perfectionism in America was “a swing toward warmth, feeling, experience, and morality” and away from the mechanical, permissive, de-ethicalized, and formal worship of the times. ... [It was a] “heart religion,” as Wesley termed it.²⁷

²⁶ Fletcher, Last Check to Antinomianism, Section 19.

²⁷ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle 129-44.

1801. The Cane Ridge Camp Meeting

The great Cane Ridge camp meeting in Kentucky in 1801 was an early American Pentecostal type revival started by the enthusiastic preaching of John McGee. This revival is where the American ‘camp meeting’ was born. It was preceded by three summers of Methodist circuit riders leading many into the sinless perfection experience.

Synan. Their “godly hysteria” included such phenomena as falling, jerking, barking like dogs, falling into trances, the “holy laugh,” and “such wild dances as David performed before the Ark of the Lord.” ... Peter Cartwright reported that in one service he saw five hundred jerking at once. The unconverted were as subject to the “jerks” as were the saints. ... After “praying through” some would crawl on all fours and bark like dogs, thus “treeing the devil.” Others would fall into trances for hours, awakening to claim salvation or sanctification. In some services entire congregations would be seized by the “holy laugh.” [A] most amazing phenomenon was the “singing exersize” whereby the saints ... “would sing most melodiously, not from the mouth or nose, but entirely in the breast.” ... In the revival that hit the University of Georgia in 1800-1801, students visited nearby campgrounds and were themselves smitten with the “jerks” or slain in the spirit ... or they shouted and talked in unknown tongues.²⁸

1800-1850. The Second Great Awakening

Wikipedia. Western New York, was dubbed the ‘burned-over district,’ because of its recurring

²⁸ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle 159-77.

waves of revival in the early 1800's. "Like the First Great Awakening a half century earlier, the Second reflected Romanticism characterized by enthusiasm, emotion, and an appeal to the super-natural. ... It rejected the ... rationalism [of the] the Enlightenment."²⁹ Western New York was frontier country at this time, opened for development by the creation of the Erie Canal. The original Puritan settlers in America had feared that the frontier wilderness would allow men to escape the oversight of civilization and invent all kinds of doctrines, and their fears were realized. Many new cults and movements began at this time and place, often from supposed new divine revelations. Joseph Smith founded the Mormons, Ann Lee the Shakers, William Miller the Millerites from which came the Seventh Day Adventists and Jehovah Witnesses. The Fox Sisters table-rapping fraud gave impetus to the Spiritualism movement. Washington Gladden started the Social Gospel movement. Elizabeth Cady Stanton helped organize the Seneca Falls Convention which was the first women's rights convention.³⁰

1820. Charles Finney

Warfield. Here was this young man, but two years a minister, but four a Christian, ... suddenly leading an assault upon the churches. "Force was his factor, and 'breaking down' his process." And in exercising this force he did not shrink from denunciations which bordered on the defamatory. ... Parishes were invaded without invitation, churches divided, opposing ministers "broken down," or even driven from their pulpits, the people

²⁹ Wikipedia, Second Great Awakening.

³⁰ Wikipedia, Burned-Over District.t

everywhere set and kept on edge. Finney was under no illusions as to the nature of this excitement or as to its dangers. ... It served him in other words as a means of “advance publicity.” “It seems sometimes to be indispensable,” he says, “that a high degree of excitement should prevail for a time, to arrest public and individual attention, and to draw people off from other pursuits to attend to the concerns of their souls.”... Joseph Ives Foot, writing in 1838, is constrained to say: “During ten years, hundreds, and perhaps thousands, were annually reported to be converted on all hands; but now it is admitted, that his (Finney’s) real converts are comparatively few. It is declared, even by himself, that ‘the great body of them are a disgrace to religion.’ ... In propagating these revivals everything was bent to the production of the excited state of feeling that was aimed at, and all ordinary Christian duties were in abeyance, ... the whole charitable work of the churches fell away, and even the Sabbath Schools were neglected.”³¹

Synan. The man most responsible for reinstating and refining the revival was ... Finney, ... raised in [the burned-over district of] western part of New York. ... During the 1820’s he led revivals of spectacular proportions, using what he termed the “new measures” of evangelization.³²

Naselli. Two significant parts of the holiness movement were Methodist perfectionism and Oberlin perfectionism. ... Its two main proponents were Charles Finney (1792–1875) and Asa Mahan (1799–1889). [Oberlins]

³¹ Warfield, *Perfectionism*, Kindle 217-250.

³² Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 181-92.

taught that Christian perfection begins with a crisis of Spirit-baptism.

1823. The Mormons

Synan. Even the Mormon Church experienced much the same motor phenomena that characterized the early Methodists and later Pentecostals. Shouting, jerking, and dancing were common in their services, and Brigham Young not only spoke in unknown tongues, but interpreted his own messages. ... Mormon choirs were even known to sing songs in unknown tongues in unison.³³

1832. The Catholic Apostolic Church

Joseph Frey was a Jewish man who accepted Yeshua as Messiah in 1795, and helped found the “London Society for Promoting Christianity Amongst the Jews (LSPCAJ) in 1809. His Jewish background helped him promote a literal interpretation of the scriptures including the premillennial return of Messiah.³⁴ An Anglican priest, James Stewart was an active supporter of the LSPCAJ. In 1820, he published and distributed more than half a million copies of a pamphlet in Great Britain, the United States, and Europe, urging ‘Christians’ to pray for the outpouring of the Holy Spirit as the only hope before the Lord’s return. “The Scriptures predict a day when the Holy Spirit shall be given in a very abundant manner; and that this blessing will be preceded by earnest prayer. ... Oh! for the fatness of the latter rain.”³⁵ In 1830, in supposed answer to the prayer movement; prophecy, speaking in tongues,

³³ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 181-92.

³⁴ Frey, *Narrative*.

³⁵ Stewart, *Memoir*.

and miraculous healing broke out among protestants in Port Glasgow, Scotland, and among Roman Catholics in Karlshuld, Bavaria.

Edward Irving was a Church of Scotland minister who preached that Jesus was returning soon. He helped create and lead the Catholic Apostolic Church in 1832 which included restored apostles and prophets, miracles, and spiritual gifts. Irving considered tongues as the standing sign of the “baptism with the Holy Ghost,” and the “root and stem” from which all other gifts flow.

There were seven congregations, six of which were led by an apostle, also called angels. Six more persons were designated as apostles in 1835 after Irving’s death, to bring the total to twelve. Henry Drummond, a member of parliament, was an apostle, and Thomas Carlyle attended. The apostles declared the apostolate had been restored for setting all Christianity in order to be ready for the Second Coming, and they called on all clergy and secular authorities to submit to their self-appointment as apostles.

Three ranks of ministry were recognized: bishop, priest, and deacon. Each rank had different vestments. The ministries of Apostle (or Elder), Prophet, Evangelist, and Pastor (or Teacher) determined the border colors of their vestments. There were combinations of rank and border. There were angel-prophets, angel-evangelists, priest-prophets, priest-elders, deacon-pastors, deacon-prophets, and so on. The last apostle died in 1901.³⁶

³⁶ Wikipedia, Catholic Apostolic Church.

1832. Spiritual Wives

Dixon. In the year 1832, ... a great revival of religion ... took place. ... By a sudden prompting from within, so far as men could see, a number of orderly and reputable persons began to ask each other ... how it stood with them in the great account. ... At first the old and steady preachers welcomed this change of mind; their pews being ... filled. ... A service once a-week was but as a drop of water on the lips of men and women panting for a living brook. ... An evening meeting was called for prayer; then a morning meeting; afterwards an hour was snatched from the busy noon. ... School-rooms, dancing-halls, even theatres, ... became a church. ... Camps were formed for prayer. ... Hundreds of wandering and unauthorized preachers, male and female, took the field against Satan, and ... the regular clergy came to be esteemed as dumb and faithless. ... Miss Lucina Umphreville ... held that the females must not think of love; that the men must not woo them; that the church must not celebrate the marriage rite; and that those who had already passed beneath the yoke must live as though they had not. ... Male and female were to be brother and sister only. ... Erasmus Stone, a revival preacher at Salina, ... had seen a vision of the night. A mighty host of men and women filled the sky. ... They began to ... fly hither and thither. ... Every... soul [trying] to find its natural [brother/sister] mate [regardless of who they might already be married to].³⁷

³⁷ Dixon, *Spiritual Wives* Vol. 2, 1-16.

1846. John Humphrey Noyes

John Humphrey Noyes was a product of Finney's revivals in Putney, New York, in 1831. Noyes eventually created a commune at Putney in 1846 in which all wives were shared. When the townspeople drove them out, they moved to Oneida, NY. Lawsuits from that town eventually caused them to abandon their shared marriage practice. Noyes fled to Canada, and what was left of the commune became the Oneida silverware company.

1846. Warfield. On John Humphrey Noyes.

The "saints" had advanced beyond the legalities of the worldly order ... [to] the freedom of the resurrection life. ... The idea of spiritual wives did not go far enough to satisfy the demands of [Noyes's] antinomianism. ... He writes, "[Christ] said, that in the good time coming there will be no marriage at all" - meaning not that celibacy will rule, but "promiscuity." ... All communism is wrecked on the family, and he perceived ... that he must be rid of the family if he was to have communism. ... His book called "Bible Communism," published in 1848, was nothing more than an elaborate plea for the practice of ... community not only in goods but also in women. ... It was in May, 1846, so Noyes tells us, that "entire communism" was put into practice. ... From this time every man in the association ... looked on every woman in it as his wife, and every woman looked on every man as her husband. ... Noyes called it "free love."³⁸

³⁸ Warfield, *Perfectionism*, Kindle 3000-388.

1843. The Higher Life Movement Splits Off

Whenever there's a split over doctrine, it not only results in a dilution of numbers, but also in a concentration of extremism within the two parties. Boardman didn't like the term 'sinless perfection' which was sometimes doctrinally opposed because of the terminology, so he preferred the term 'full salvation.'

1843. Phoebe Palmer. The Way of Holiness

Palmer's altar crisis theology ...

1843. Phoebe Palmer. *The Way of Holiness.* [Sinless Perfection] Provision has thus been made for the restoration of man ... [to] regain that which was lost in Adam - even the image of God re-enstamped upon the soul (Kindle 21273-21275). [Let Go] By the determination to consecrate all upon the altar of sacrifice to God, ... to be wholly the Lord's for time and eternity," and then acting in conformity with this decision, actually laying all upon the altar, ... under the most solemn obligation [Let God] to believe that the sacrifice became the Lord's property; and by virtue of the altar upon which the offering was laid, became "holy" and "acceptable" (Kindle 21286-21290). ... Scripturally assured that it was needful ... to place himself believingly upon "the altar that sanctifieth the gift" (Kindle 21330-21331).

1858. Boardman. The Higher Christian Life

Boardman just changed the terminology.

1858. Boardman. *The Higher Christian Life*.³⁹

This one word, perfectionism, has kept and is now keeping thousands from examining into the matter at all. It is high time this stumbling stone was gathered out of the way ... of [those] who are deterred by it from gaining the heights, and deeper depths. (p. 29) ... Many ... fear heresy. ... So much has been written about “perfection” and “sanctification” [being] in conflict with the Bible. (p. 6) ... Scores upon scores ... have given themselves wholly to Jesus, and taken Jesus wholly to themselves, and so found the abiding sunshine, and ... full salvation, but who yet make no profession of perfection. (p. 17) ... Cases [of it] have generally received the convenient name, “second conversion:” but in the standards, as in the Westminster Church Confession, it is called, “The full assurance of grace and salvation,” and elsewhere, “The full assurance of faith,” while in hymns it is often named, “Full salvation.” (p. 25)

The Bible teaches men can only be justified by faith, and then work as part of sanctification. But Boardman recommends we let go and let God to receive ‘sanctification by faith.’ However, the only place ‘sanctified by faith’ is found, it indicates all believers are ‘sanctified,’ meaning ‘set apart,’ the moment we’re justified. “I send you ... to open their eyes, ... so that they may receive forgiveness of sins, and inheritance among them which are sanctified by [justifying] faith that is in me,” Acts 26:17-18. Boardman even believed the second blessing experience is required in order to go to heaven, though ‘millions’ of born-again believers through the ages have known nothing about it. The Bible

³⁹ Boardman, *Higher Christian Life*.

does say all who have been justified are being sanctified, but it doesn't say they're sanctified by a crisis experience after justification.

1858. Boardman. *The Higher Christian Life.*

After having found acceptance in Jesus by faith, we think to go on to perfection by strugglings and resolves. ... Lutherans, Wesleyans, and Oberlinians ... all agree ... [in] the experience ... of sanctification by faith. (p. 23-4) ... All [who come] to a sense of sins forgiven ... in the blood of Jesus [justification], ... sooner or later [come] hungering and thirsting for true holiness, ... and after varied strugglings [find] in Christ the end of the law for sanctification. (p. 18)... It is necessary for all to come to the point of trusting in the Lord for purity of heart [sanctification] to be prepared for heaven. ... None but the pure in heart shall see God in peace. ... It is a point that must be gained, or heaven must be lost. Millions have lived life-long in ignorance of it. ... All those professors of religion, ... if really converted, then the way of sanctification by faith in Jesus will be made plain in the evening of their earthly course [just before they die they'll be given a sanctification crisis experience]. (p. 97-9)

It doesn't take a lot of discernment to recognize a man's message as false, when says followers of the doctrine he's promoting are in a higher position than others in the Congregation. Boardman's message denigrates the fullness that Jesus provides all believers the moment they're justified.

1858. Boardman. *The Higher Christian Life.*

Exactly what is attained in this [sanctification] experience? Christ. ... Christ is received by the

soul as the potter to mold it. ... A new and higher level has been reached ... and from the new starting point the race becomes swifter and yet easier. (p. 26-7) ... The new starting point of a higher progress, [is] just as distinctly marked as conversion itself. ... A deeper, stronger vital union with the True Vine. ... A higher and happier progress. (p. 88-90) ... The apostles [were successful] in winning men to the higher experience - the baptism of the Holy Ghost. (p. 93)

Jesus is 'an ever present Savior' and 'a friend which sticketh closer than a brother' to all who have been justified. Jesus is with every believer, every day, contrary to what Boardman says.

1858. Boardman. *The Higher Christian Life.*

They of the one class have a Saviour in Jesus it is true - but he is a Saviour afar off - up in heaven, as they think of him, and not with them now here upon earth. While they of the other class have Jesus ever with them - a very present help in every time of need - a friend which sticketh closer than a brother. ... Jesus has been with me every day now. (p. 140)

Boardman is wrong that some believers have more union with Messiah than other believers. The manifestation of the union varies, but no brother has more or less union.

1858. Boardman. *The Higher Christian Life.*

There is such an experimental union with Jesus as has for convenience been named second conversion. (p. 60) ... The life hidden with Christ in God. (p. 144) ... O for that living union with Jesus! ... There will be gathered at our house tomorrow evening, the parlors full

of those ... recently come out into the fulness of faith, ... this abiding vital union of Christians with Christ. (p. 145) ... Abiding in Jesus we shall be watchful and prayerful, diligent and faithful, secure from the adversary and cheerful as the lark. ... He in whom Christ dwells by faith [meaning only higher-life believers] ... will grow in grace; for he has a living union with Him. (p. 149-150)

Boardman believed 'revivals' are due to second blessing experiences, whereas they are probably due more to emotional preaching and crowd psychology. He believed God was making such teaching more prominent now, versus the past thousands of years, to bring in the Millennial Kingdom. He even thought atheists were becoming fewer and fewer [?!].

1858. Boardman. *The Higher Christian Life*. [Mahan and Finny] began then to preach the full gospel. (p. 29) ... The secret spring touched by the Lord a hundred years ago to throw open the doors for ... tens of thousands ... [to the] experience of full salvation [was] in the leaders, ... [like] Edwards, the Wesleys, and Whitefield. (p. 146-7) ... Why has the fact not had greater prominence in the past? (p. 101) ... As years roll on the natural sciences unfold and lead even skeptical minds to abandon atheism. ... What now the timely truth? ... The millennial type of Christian character and life. ... [God] is now erecting the temple, ... story above story, in preparation for the millennium. (p. 104-5) ... We need, therefore, to turn attention increasingly to the higher form of Christian experience. (p. 108-9)

1872. Naselli. On the Higher Life Movement. After [Mahan] moved to England in 1872, he helped lead the higher life movement, which immediately preceded the first Keswick Convention in 1875. ... The higher life movement began in 1858 when William Boardman's popular book *The Higher Christian Life* was released, and it dissolved in 1875 when its leaders removed Robert Pearsall Smith from public ministry. ... [Boardman] began and led the higher life movement for over a decade until a husband-wife team - Robert and Hannah Smith - overshadowed him in the early 1870s, ... most enduringly through Hannah's writing ... *The Christian's Secret of a Happy Life*, [which] is essentially two steps: 1."entire surrender" or "entire abandonment" (i.e., "let go") 2."absolute faith" (i.e., "let God"). ... Hannah's intense feminism and independence, Robert's manic-depressive nature, and ... persistence in unrepentant adultery all contributed to a very unhappy marriage. ... Robert apostatized and became an agnostic. ... Hannah apostatized, ... rejoined the Quakers in 1886, and embraced universalism and religious pluralism [multiple ways to be saved].

1875. Smith. The Christians Secret to a Happy Life

Hannah and her husband both came from a long line of Quakers, and as stated above, both eventually apostatized, which means they never knew God in the first place.

1 Jn. 2:19. They went out from us, but they were not [ever] of us; for if they had been of us, they would no doubt have continued with us;

but they went out, that they might be made manifest that they were not all of us.

Like the mystics before her, Smith taught 'sanctification by faith,' is achieved by letting go and letting God.

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life*.⁴⁰ According to our faith it shall be unto us. Then we trusted Him for our justification, and it became ours; now we must trust Him for our sanctification, and it shall become ours also. ... Then He lifted us out of the pit, now He is to seat us in heavenly places with Himself [Eph. 1:3 and 2:6 says we're already there]. ... Theologically and judicially I know that every believer has everything the minute he is converted. But experimentally nothing is his until by faith he claims it. ... To enter into this blessed interior life of rest and triumph, you have two steps to take: first, [Let Go:] entire abandonment; and second, [Let God:] absolute faith. ... These two steps ... will certainly bring you ... into the green pastures and still waters of this higher Christian life.

Ceasing from all efforts is supposedly an essential 'secret,' meaning it's not in the Bible, at least not the way Smith teaches it.

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life*. When you have got hold of this secret, ... all the Scriptural commands - to yield yourself to God, to present yourself a living sacrifice to Him, to abide in Christ, to walk in the light, to die to self - become possible to you (p. 46) [this selection of commands versus the multitude about working shows Smith's lopsided view of

⁴⁰ Smith, *Christian's Secret*.

scripture]. You need make no efforts to grow; but let your efforts instead be all concentrated on this, that you abide in the Vine. (p. 63). ... The essential thing is to get within you the growing life [she means you don't already have it by regeneration], and then you cannot help but grow. (p. 65). ... It is a fact that the most effectual workers I know are those who do not feel the least care or anxiety about their work, ... asking Him to guide them moment by moment in reference to it (p. 72).

Unlike Paul ...

2 Cor. 11:27-8. In weariness and painfulness, in watchings often, in hunger and thirst, in fastings often, in cold and nakedness. Beside those things that are without, that which comes on me daily, the care of all the Congregations.

Like the mystics before her, Smith didn't believe God is able to accomplish his purposes unless we 'let him.' There is actually more fruitfulness, for those who don't rely on Smith's false method of surrender for sanctification, than for those who do.

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life.* God says, "Yield yourselves up unto Me, as those that are alive from the dead, and I will work in you to will and to do of my good pleasure [the scriptures don't make Rom. 6:13 a prerequisite to Phil. 2:13 as Smith does]." ... [He] will ... work in you ... [Hebrews 13:21], but ... if you begin to question your surrender, ... He cannot work. [What version of the Bible is this? What about the promise "being confident of this very thing, that he which has begun a good work in you will perform it until the day

of Jesus Messiah” (Phil. 1:6)?] But while you trust, He works ... to change you into the image of Christ, from glory to glory, by His mighty Spirit. (pp. 33-34).

Biblically, we receive a new master, a new husband, a new mind, and the indwelling Holy Spirit at the time of our justification. This causes every born-again believer, without fail, to love serving God, whether or not they do Smith’s false surrender ritual.

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life*. [After you perform Christian service do you rebound] like an India-rubber ball back into your real interests and pleasures the moment your work [is] over? [If so, it’s actually because you’ve never been regenerated by justification by faith.] ... The soul ... that enters fully into the blessed life of faith ... finds itself itself really wanting to do the things God wants it to do. (p. 69). ... The new covenant ... shall be a law written within. [So non-higher-life Christians are not under the New Covenant in Jesus’ blood?] ... Put your will over completely into the hands of your Lord. ... Say, “Yes, Lord, yes!”

Charismatic type direct revelation from God by inner impressions is an essential part of Smith’s higher life, as with all mystics.

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life*. You have not learned yet to know the voice of the Good Shepherd, and are therefore in great doubt and perplexity as to what really is His will. ... If I have an impression, therefore, I must see if it is in accordance with Scripture, and whether it commends itself to my own

higher judgment [i.e. common sense], and also whether, as we Quakers say, the “way opens” for its carrying out. (p. 78). ... Just as the Holy Spirit may tell us, by impressions, what is the will of God concerning us, so also will ... spiritual enemies tell us, by impressions, what is their will concerning us. (p. 78) ... This direct communication of God’s will to us ... seems to me to be the grandest of privileges. ... That God should love me enough to care about the details of my life is perfectly wonderful. ... The way in which the Holy Spirit, therefore, usually works in His direct guidance is to impress upon the mind a wish or desire to do or leave undone certain certain things. The soul when engaged, perhaps, in prayer, feels a sudden suggestion made to its inmost consciousness. At the moment when the Spirit speaks, it is always easy to obey; if the soul hesitates and begins to reason, it becomes more and more difficult continually. As a general rule, the first convictions are the right ones in a fully surrendered heart; for God ... will cause His voice to be heard before any other voices [what verse is this?]. Such convictions, therefore, should never be met by reasoning. ... God’s children are amazingly skeptical here [thank God for those who are!]. ... ‘God, who at sundry times and in manners many, Spake to the fathers and is speaking still’ [she misquotes the end which says past tense has ... spoken to us by his Son,’ Heb. 1:2]. (p. 81-83)

Though Smith begins by saying we should focus only on trusting, and do nothing except let God do everything; she then contradicts herself and says if we don’t follow, obey, and act on the Spirit’s leading, it will break the higher life relationship. Smith (and others) count performing actions in obedience to

the commands of the Bible (the light without) to be self-striving; but count performing the same actions in obedience to inner impressions and feelings, supposedly from the Spirit (the light within), to be doing nothing, but he Bible doesn't say that.

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life*. Any root of bitterness cherished towards another, any self-seeking and harsh judgments indulged in, any slackness in obeying the voice of the Lord, any doubtful habits or surroundings, ... will effectually cripple and paralyze our spiritual life [sounds pretty iffy at maintaining it at best]. (p. 98). ... As pilgrims and strangers we must abstain from fleshly lusts that war against the soul [sounds like work]. As good soldiers of Jesus Christ, we must disentangle ourselves from the affairs of this life ... that we may please Him who hath chosen us to be soldiers. We must abstain from all appearance of evil. We must be kind one to another, tenderhearted, forgiving one another. ... Into all these things we shall undoubtedly be led by the blessed Spirit of God, if we give ourselves up to His guidance, ... faithful[ly] following ... the Lord in a consecrated soul. ... Be perfectly pliable in His wise hands, go where He entices you, turn away from all from which He makes you shrink, obey Him perfectly [sounds like just as much work as working is]; and He will lead you out swiftly and easily ... into the realization and conscious experience of the most blessed union with the Lord, ... baptizing ... with the Holy Ghost. (pp. 109-113)

Like all mystics, Smith considers herself, and those who follow her advice, to be on a higher plane than all other born-again believers.

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life*. If the majority of the Church were to be named over again, the only fitting and descriptive name that could be given them would be that of Doubters [she doesn't like God calling believers that like in Acts 5:14 and 1 Tim. 4:12]. ... They have got rid, it may be, of the old doubts that once tormented them, as to whether their sins are really forgiven, ... but they have not got rid of doubting. They have simply shifted the habit to a higher platform. (p. 103). ... [She describes one] who had been living for several months in the enjoyment of full salvation. ... [and one] who had been living in the land of promise about two weeks, and who had had a very bright and victorious experience. ... [Versus those who] have never entered into the life of full trust. ... [Sin, if confessed] will not take you out of the land of rest. ... This life of full salvation. (p. 96-97)

Like the other mystics, much of Smith's doctrine is based on a misinterpretation of Romans 5-8.

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life*. It is thus that we have "access by faith" into ... grace ... [Romans 5:2] ... to stand [Rom. 5:2 actually says we had access into justification and grace for sanctification at the same past faith event]. (32) ... Enroll your name in this army today (p. 75). ... We are predestined to be "conformed to the image" [Romans 8:29] of God's Son [if we're predestined, won't it come to pass even without Smith's steps?]. This means, of course, not a likeness of bodily presence, but a likeness of character [actually, it does mean a bodily likeness via future bodily resurrection and glorification]. (p. 114).

Like Boardman, Smith didn't understand that union with God in Messiah is something all the justified partake of in a way that really affects their lives. Smith didn't understand that from the time of Pentecost on, all believers receive the life-changing, indwelling Holy Spirit the moment they're justified.

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life.* You know the mind of your Lord about many things, in which, as yet, they [the non-higher life Christians] are walking in darkness. ... Is it a cause for regret that your soul is brought into such near and intimate relations with your Master, that He is able to tell you things which those who are further off may not know? (p. 116) ... Will you think it hard that He reveals to you more of His mind than He does to others (p. 118). In a thousand ways He makes this offer of oneness with Himself [which we already have per John 17:21, 23] to every believer. But all do not say "Yes," to Him. (p. 119). ... This soul-union ... is realized as an actual experience by many of God's dear children. ... It is true of all, ... but the eyes of many are too dim and their hearts too unbelieving. ... The usual course of Christian experience is pictured in the history of the disciples. (p. 122). They knew Christ only "after the flesh," as outside of them, ... but not yet their Life. Then came Pentecost, and these disciples came to know Him ... as one with them in actual union. ... Henceforth He was to them [and actually to every born-again believer since then even without Smith's methods] Christ within, working in them to will and to do of His good pleasure. ... They were made one with Him. ... Unless we are Christ-like in our thoughts and our ways, we are not one with Him. (p. 124). ... Thy Lord will not force it on thee ... The steps are but three.

First, be convinced that the Scriptures teach this glorious indwelling of thy God [the scriptures teach it takes place at justification and regeneration]; then surrender thy whole being to Him to be possessed by Him; and finally believe that He has taken possession, and is dwelling in thee. Begin to reckon thyself dead, and to reckon Christ as thy only life. Maintain this attitude of soul unwaveringly [good luck]. (pp. 128-129)

Smith's book is an amalgamation of things she read from other mystics, Quakers, previous higher life proponents, etc. The allegorical admonitions she gives in some chapters, contradict the pictures she presents in others, but then the first six words of her book are "This is not a theological book."

1875. Smith. *The Christians Secret to a Happy Life*. Fenelon says somewhere ... (p. 43). ... All the old mystic writers tell us that our progress is ... by a simple, peaceful turning to God. (p. 100). ... There comes ... a region of mountain heights of uninterrupted union and communion with God, of superhuman detachment from everything earthly, of infinite contentment with the Divine will, and of marvelous transformation into the image of Christ. (p. 134). ... [For] a soul that has been raised to a throne in this inward kingdom, no sin or temptation can overcome, no sorrow can crush, no discouragement can hinder. (p. 139). ... But perhaps thou wilt say, "How can I enter into this kingdom, if I am not already in?" (p. 144). Except ye be converted, and become as little children, ye shall not enter into the kingdom of heaven [isn't this a justification verse?]. ... Let everything go, then, that belongs to the natural; all your own notions, and plans,

and ways, and thoughts; and accept in their stead God's plans, and ways, and thoughts. Do this faithfully and do it persistently [good luck], and you shall come at last to sit on His throne, and to reign with Him in an interior kingdom. ... There is no other way. (p. 145). ... We pray daily, "Thy kingdom come." [Matthew 6:10] Do we know what we are praying for? [Does she?] (p. 147).

1875-1913. Naselli on Keswick, Victorious Life, America's Keswick, Trumbull. In 1874, Evan Hopkins preached on John 4:46-50 at a meeting led by Robert Pearsall Smith. Hopkins distinguished between the nobleman's "seeking faith" and "resting faith." Hearing this, Harford-Battersby had his crisis moment when his "seeking faith" became a "resting faith" [actually the nobleman had no saving faith at all until what Hopkins called 'resting faith']. Harford-Battersby and Robert Wilson decided to hold a similar meeting in their hometown of Keswick, a small town in northwest England. They asked Robert Pearsall Smith to chair their meeting, but Smith fell from ministry just a few days before the first Keswick Convention began in 1875. Keswick has hosted the week-long Keswick Convention each July since 1875, ... [teaching] a crisis in which to enter "the rest of faith."

The victorious life movement was the American version of the Keswick movement. ... It began in 1913 and promoted higher life theology for decades. It's three primary leaders were Griffith Thomas, Charles Trumbull, and Robert McQuilkin. ... "No crisis before Wednesday" was a common saying at the early Keswick Conventions because the first two days (Monday and Tuesday) laid the

groundwork for the crisis of consecration. ...
 “What are the conditions of this Victorious
 Life? Only two, and they are very simple.
 Surrender and faith. ‘Let go, and let God.’”⁴¹

Trumbull was the publisher of The Sunday School Times in Philadelphia.⁴² Like the others, Trumbull taught the higher state is entered by letting go and letting God. He says it’s obtained by praising, not asking; but sometimes he contradicts himself and says it’s obtained by asking. But like Smith, he wasn’t overly concerned with having a consistent theology. “I saw that Christ was my life. Christ was my victory. I wasn’t bothering about the theological questions.” (Kindle 537-538)

1923. Charles Trumbull, The Victorious Life

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*.
 Jesus, you know, makes two offers to everyone. He offers to set us free from the penalty of our sin. And He offers to set us free from the power of our sin. Both these offers are made on exactly the same terms: we can accept them only by letting Him do it all [without quoting scriptural support]. ... Many Christians mistakenly think ... they must have some part in overcoming the power of their sin; that their efforts, their will, their determination, strengthened and helped by the power of Christ, is the way to victory. (Kindle 31-35)
 ... The secret of victory is not praying, but praising: not asking, but thanking. (Kindle 664). A life that wins; ... the life of Jesus Christ; ... may be our life for the asking [isn’t this a prayer?]. (Kindle 195)

⁴¹ Naselli, No Quick Fix, Kindle 157 696-700.

⁴² Trumbull, Victorious Life.

Like the others, Trumbull limits what the Bible says about all who have been justified, to the select group that believe their way into the state of victorious life.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*.

It was Christ's wish and purpose that every follower of His should be a wellspring of living, gushing water of life all the time to others. ... "He that believeth on me... out of his belly shall flow rivers of living water [this verse actually says it's true of all who are justified by faith, not just that Jesus wishes it were so, also Jn. 4:14]." ... Some have a little of the water of life, bringing it up in small bucketfuls and at intervals, like the irrigating water wheel of India, with a good deal of creaking and grinding; while from the lives of others it flows all the time in a life-bringing, abundant stream. ... The blessings that Christ gives us in the Victorious Life - in the ninefold "fruit of the Spirit" (Galatians 5:22, 23), for example - are so wonderful. [Other justified Christians don't have the fruit of the Spirit or don't have 'wonderful' fruit of the Spirit?} (Kindle 792-4). ... [Life-that-wins means] a revolutionized, fundamentally changed life, within and without. If any man be in Christ, you know, there is a new creation [he rebuts his own teaching by quoting this verse]. (Kindle 200-1)

Like the others, Trumbull taught that God needs our permission to be able to accomplish his purposes for those who have been justified. Actually, God will accomplish his goal of a holy walk in every brother. We can only affect the degree of practical holiness. "The testing of your faith [without fail] produces endurance; but let endurance have her complete work, that you may be complete and entire, lacking nothing," Jas. 1:3-4.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*. A life that wins; ... the life of Jesus Christ; ... may be our life for the asking, if we let Him - in absolute, unconditional surrender of ourselves to Him. ... Jesus Christ ... does not want us to work for Him [unlike Paul, ‘a servant of Jesus Messiah,’ Rom. 1:1]. He wants us to let Him do His work through us [he wants to serve himself?]. ... An utterly new kind of service will be ours now, as we let Christ serve others through us, using us.

Like the others, Trumbull says we must not do anything.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*. If you have to work for your victory, it is not the real thing. (Kindle Locations 255-256). Have you rest in all your work as a clergyman, and in your parish troubles?” (Kindle 645-646)

Unlike Paul ...

2 Cor. 11:28. NIV: Besides everything else, I face daily the pressure of my concern for all the churches. ASV: Besides those things that are without, there is that which presseth upon me daily, anxiety for all the churches. CEV: Besides everything else, each day I am burdened down, worrying about all the churches. VOICE: As if these external trials weren’t enough, there is the daily stress I feel and anxiety I carry for all the churches under my care.

Besides, it doesn’t really sound like Trumbull’s ‘victorious life’ is experientially any better than every believer’s life.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*. Victory is entered upon by a single act of faith, as is salvation. But suppose the believer, having experienced the miracle of victory over sin through trusting his Lord's sufficiency, comes, somehow, to doubt that sufficiency? At once his victory is broken; and he fails. ... The peril just here is, ... that we shall think we never had the blessing we thought we had. (Kindle 690-8). ... We always have our sinful nature, which can sin and will sin any moment that we fail to trust Christ for His victory in us. (Kindle 720-2). ... The Victorious Victorious Life is not the untempted life, but it is the most tempted life that anyone can live. ... One never knows the full meaning of temptation until he has dared to trust Christ for full victory. Then come the temptations as never before: desperate, diabolical, hellish, subtle, refined, gross, spiritual, fleshly - the whole gamut of all the deception and the down pull that the world, the flesh, and the Devil can bring to the soul of a child of God. (Kindle 683-7). The Christian who knows Christ as victory can let slip some word criticizing a fellow Christian who is not in the secret [lol]. ... The instant one speaks ... or thinks in his inmost heart thus of another, his victory is gone; he has sinned. (Kindle 801-4). There is something about the life of spiritual power and victory that, when broken into in the slightest way by unbelief, seems to expose one most terribly to sins of gross immorality and degradation. (Kindle 873-4). May God keep us from ever daring to go to sleep with unconfessed sin ... and in conscious loss of the victory. (Kindle 884-885).

Like the others, Trumbull requires victorious life people to spend their lives trying to hear and follow direct revelation from God.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*. The believer has found great blessing in listening to the voice of the Holy Spirit, and in instant obedience to His leadings; and when Satan speaks, giving leadings in direction that of themselves are entirely right [but not for this person at this time], the unsuspecting believer follows those leadings, no blessing results, and then follow anxiety, confusion, perhaps doubt and fog. God prompts us, for example, to speak to this or that one about Jesus as Saviour. ... God's leadings may be so blessed and so unmistakable that, as we testify to others about them, we speak of how "God said this to me," or "God led me to do that." ... Is it not better ... to say, "I believe God would have me do this"? Let us recognize that we may be mistaken. (Kindle 726-792). ... All this is not imaginary [are you sure?]. (Kindle 815-8). ... The history of the so-called "higher life" experience among Christians through the ... centuries, ... had gone onto the rocks [he got that right] ... supposing that they had, by Christ and the Holy Spirit within them, all that they needed, and could therefore safely pay little attention to the Bible. (Kindle 845-8).

What his victorious life people are actually after, like higher life people, is their own greatness and spiritual pleasure, because of their own pride, self-centeredness, and spiritual immaturity.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*. We used to think that the more we studied the Bible, the more victorious we should be. We used to think that the more time we spent in prayer, the more victory we could have. (Kindle 834-6). Our early experiences in the life of victory are likely to be so different from

anything we have known before, so out of the ordinary in supernatural demonstration of God's grace and power, that ... we mistakenly suppose we must continually be having thrilling, unexpected, supernatural evidences of God's power. (Kindle 769-72). The new blessings of victory when one first trusts Christ for it are so new, so unexpected, so overwhelming and more than satisfying. (Kindle 891-2).

Like the other Let-Goers, much of Trumbull's wrong doctrine comes from a misinterpretation of Romans 5-8.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*. In Romans 5:10 we read: "For if, when we were enemies ... we were reconciled to God by the death of his Son, much more ... we shall be saved by his life." ... We were saved by His death. Now ... if we but believe [the Bible doesn't add this condition for Rom. 5:10], we shall be kept safe (from the power of sin) in His life. ... That is the whole message of Romans 6. (Kindle 501-5).

Like the others, Trumbull thinks it's an astonishing tragedy that brethren can understand justification by an act of faith, but not sanctification by an act of faith. It really shouldn't seem so astonishing, since the Bible teaches one, but not the other.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*. A young woman student [at Moody Bible Institute] came to me [and said,] "I can't seem to get the faith for victory." "Are you saved?" I asked her. "Oh, yes," she said. "What makes you think you are saved?" "Why," she said, "I know I am; John 3:16 settles that." ... "Well,

then,” I answered, “you have all the faith you need, and you are using it. For it’s the faith that you are already using ... for your salvation that is the only faith you need for victory.” (Kindle 547-576). ... The tragedy of it, is that the Christian people of our land have not been taught the truth in this matter. (Kindle 263). ... The Christian who is wholly trusting the Lord for victory ... may be in close contact with Christians who are older, much farther along in many ways, yet not living in the victory-secret [if it’s a secret, why is he surprised most Christians don’t know it?]. (Kindle 798-800)

But like the others, Trumbull doesn’t really mean we are to do nothing except trust. He, like the rest, means something else, though they don’t clarify exactly what they do mean.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*. Those who have found the joy and blessing of the deep things of God are often careless in keeping appointments with their fellow men, careless about answering letters, careless about money matters. ... The Christian who is trusting Christ for full victory dishonors Christ if he does not establish, and maintain a reputation for being utterly dependable. (Kindle 849-52). ... Let us be very careful, too, about social courtesies. ... Christians rejoicing in Christ as Victory sometimes need to “learn first to shew piety at home. (Kindle 912-35). There is no such thing as a gradual gift. And victory is a gift. ... God wants us to grow after we have entered into victory [So why not grow before and instead?]. (Kindle 292)

What Trumbull really means by do nothing, is do nothing unpleasant; only do it if it feels good. God

does make every brother a new creature and changes his desires through the indwelling Holy Spirit the moment he becomes a brother by becoming justified, not as the result of entering a higher state of victorious life.

1923. Charles Trumbull, *The Victorious Life*. Victory is not ... concealing your wrong feelings. ... For purely selfish reasons [a businessman sometimes] does not let the other know how he feels. But there is no grace, no miracle, no victory in that. ... Anybody can keep from boiling over. ... The counterfeit victory means a struggle [Paul said, “strive together with me,” Rom. 15:30]. ... In real victory, He does it all. We do not dare to help [Paul says, “work, ... for ... God ... works,” Phil. 2:12]. ... We are to use our will to accept the gift of victory: we are not to make an effort to win the victory [Paul said, “I run, ... [I] fight, I keep my body under,” 1 Cor. 9:26-27. “I have fought a good fight,” 2 Tim. 4:7]. ... [In] the effortless life ... we use our will to believe, to receive, but not to exert effort. (Kindle 296-402).

1907-2019. Keswick and America’s Keswick

A Keswick-authorized publication from 1907 ties this end of the chain back to its anchor in the unsaved Catholic mystics. The chapter on “The Founders and Some of the Leaders” begins with a poem of Guyon; and the chapter about Keswick writings says:

1907. Harford/Griffith Thomas. *On Keswick*. The initial impulse of the [Keswick] Movement came directly and immediately from America, though the roots of the distinctive teaching can easily be traced in the writings of Walter

Marshall, William Law, John Wesley, Fletcher of Madeley, Thomas a Kempis, Brother Lawrence, Madame Guyon, the letters of Samuel Rutherford, and the Memoir of McCheyne. It is hardly too much to say that in Marshall's [Puritan, 1628-1680] great work, "The Gospel Mystery of Sanctification," ... the essential theology of the Keswick Movement is clearly seen.

1913. Alexander. The first of the Victorious Life Conferences was held in 1913.⁴³

1924. Polluck. The Victorious Life Testimony, ... ultimately became America's Keswick. ... Not until 1924 did it find a permanent home ... in the "pine-barrens" of central New Jersey.⁴⁴

1962. Pollock. On John Stott at Keswick. John Stott ... spoke at Keswick for the first time in 1962 ... [with] exposition[s] of Scripture, directed more to the mind and will than to the emotions. ... Stott provoked considerable controversy when he returned to the Convention in 1965 and expounded Romans chapters 5-8. ... The Keswick teaching of the past had given great prominence to the call to believers to come to a point of surrender in their Christian lives in which through the Holy Spirit they knew victory over sin. ... Debates took place not so much about victory (this was already less prominent as a theme at Keswick), but about what it meant to die to sin. ... Stott challenged the view that the Christian was being told in that chapter to reckon the old sinful nature as dead through a conscious act. ... For Stott, death to sin took place in Christ's taking the penalty of sin on the Cross. ... As a

⁴³ Alexander, *Victorious Life Hymns*, iii.

⁴⁴ Pollock, *Keswick Story*, Kindle 3424-3428.

result the old life, for the believer, was finished ... at conversion. ... The secret of holy living, for Stott, was in the Christian's renewed mind. ... At the 1967 Convention, however, Alan Redpath, the founder of the Mid-America Keswick, gave an evening message on Romans 6:6 which struck a traditional Keswick note. Redpath had been present at John Stott's studies in 1965 and had been deeply unhappy. ... The views of Stott and Redpath were discussed and it was generally agreed there was a legitimate place on the Keswick platform for both points of view. But a statement by the Convention's Council (produced in 2000 for the new millennium) ... reaffirmed that the Convention was intended to encourage ... "a dependency upon the indwelling and fullness of the Holy Spirit for life transformation and effective living."⁴⁵

1979. Pollock. Spring Harvest. A stress on ... the filling of the Spirit was characteristic of Keswick from its beginnings, but in the 1960s the Convention had to respond to the emerging charismatic movement, with its introduction of an expectation of a baptism of the Holy Spirit as an experience subsequent to conversion and associated with gifts of the Spirit such as speaking in tongues. ... In 1979, Spring Harvest was initiated, ... a young people's alternative to Keswick, sponsored by British Youth For Christ. ... Spring Harvest did not start off as a charismatic event. ... Younger people began to attend Spring Harvest in large numbers, with total attendance rising to 80,000 as it spread to other venues and other weeks. ... Numbers attending student and youth meetings at Keswick began to dip, and grey hair among those in the main tent became

⁴⁵ Pollock, *Keswick Story*, Kindle 2821-2970.

increasingly in evidence. ... The youth program at Keswick had diminished to a small group when Philip Hacking brought in Dave Fenton, ... who began to revitalize the youth work and, ... it became one of the exciting and growing dimensions of the Convention.⁴⁶

2019. Current Keswick/America's Keswick Websites. The current Keswick website merely says, "From its earliest days the Keswick movement has encouraged Christians to live godly lives in the power of the Spirit." But the America's Keswick website still uses stronger language. "The core message of America's Keswick (Victorious Life) is for an individual to ... live a life of sustained fellowship with God [how could a person in Messiah not have union with God?] ... and holiness, experience victory over sin, and use their gifts for His glory. ... It is the duty of each believer to live a holy life ... by his constant dependence upon the Holy Spirit's enablement ... for victory over sin and power for service ... designated in the Scripture as the filling of the Spirit (not His baptism)."

1867-1906. The Holiness Movement

1867. The National Holiness Association

The Civil War caused many changes in the Methodist Church. The mourners' bench, holiness classes, and camp meetings fell into disuse. In 1867, several Methodist ministers called for "holding a camp meeting, the special object of which should be the promotion of the work of entire sanctification." "Irrespective of denominational ties" ... it was hoped

⁴⁶ Pollock, *Keswick Story*, Kindle 2821-2970.

all would “realize together a Pentecostal baptism of the Holy Ghost.” ... “Come, brothers and sisters of the various denominations, and let us in this forest-meeting, ... make common supplication for the descent of the Spirit upon ourselves, the church, the nation, and the world.” ... The camp meeting was held in Vineland, New Jersey, on July 17, 1867; and the organization that set it up eventually became the National Holiness Association.⁴⁷

1871. Charles Finney

Charles Finney pushed the doctrine of the baptism of the Holy Spirit for sinless perfection and empowering more strongly than Fletcher (see the subsection, “1771. Fletcher. Last Check to Antinomianism.”) “Gresham goes so far as to dub Finney ‘the grandfather of Pentecostalism.’”⁴⁸

1871. Charles Finney. Works. When [Christ] gave [the apostles] the commission to convert the world, He added, “But tarry ye in Jerusalem till ye be endued with power from on high. Ye shall be baptized with the Holy Ghost not many days hence.” ... This baptism of the Holy Ghost, ... this enduement of power from on high, ... is the indispensable condition of performing the work which he has set before us. ... No one has ... any right to expect success, unless he first secures this enduement of power from on high. The example of the first disciples teaches us how to secure this enduement. They ... continued in prayer and supplication until the Holy Ghost fell upon them on the Day of Pentecost. ... This, then, is the way to get it. ... Everybody prays for this, at

⁴⁷ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 265-296.

⁴⁸ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 3649-3650.

all times, and yet, ... few, comparatively, are really endued with this spirit of power from on high! ... How, then, is this discrepancy to be explained? ... 1st. We are not willing. ... 2d. ... The petitioner is often self-indulgent. 3d. He is uncharitable. 4th. Censorious. 5th. Self-dependent. 6th. Resists conviction of sin. ... 24th. By negligence in business, in study, in prayer. 25th. By undertaking too much business, too much study, and too little prayer. 26th. By a want of entire consecration. 27th. ... By unbelief. ... What an insult, what a blasphemy, to accuse God of lying! ... The misapprehension [is]: If we first get rid of all these [28] forms of sin ... have we not already obtained the blessing [of spiritual perfection]? ... There is a great difference between the peace and the power of the Holy Spirit in the soul. The disciples were Christians before the Day of Pentecost, and, as such, had a measure of the Holy Spirit [not so, not the indwelling Spirit which every Christian now has], ... but not the power which He had promised. ... Here is, I think, the great mistake of the Church. ... They rest in conversion, and do not seek until they obtain this enduement of power from on high.⁴⁹

The previous quotation reveals several important mistakes in Finney's doctrine. First, the disciples weren't indwelt by the Holy Spirit because they prayed, or people would have prayed down Pentecost long before Pentecost. Pentecost had to come fifty days after the first Sabbath after Passover (Lev. 23), which is also seven sevens, forty-nine days after Firstfruits. Firstfruits was fulfilled by Yeshua's resurrection, and Pentecost was fulfilled when Jews and Gentiles become his one body the Congregation

⁴⁹ Finney, Works Vol 1, Kindle 2754-2800.

when they were joined together by the indwelling Holy Spirit. Leaven, which signifies sin, was never used in Jewish temple sacrifices, except for the two leavened loaves of bread that had to be offered every year at Pentecost (Lev. 23), representing the future Congregation comprised of sinful men, both Jews and Gentiles.

Second, Finney accused people of calling God a liar for having doubts, when actually God never promised what Finney claims he promised. And third, Finney's twenty-eight reasons why a person might not receive the baptism of the Holy Spirit after praying for it, makes it impossible for anyone to know if they're asking aright anyway.

1891. R. C. Horner. Pentecost

John Wesley had taught that sinless perfection was a second blessing after justification. The Methodist-Holiness movement had focused on these two steps, 1) justification, and 2) perfect sanctification. In 1891, R. C. Horner wrote an influential book, *Pentecost*, in which he said the baptism of the Holy Spirit was a third work empowering for service after justification and sinless perfection. "Also prominent in Horner's meetings were such 'physical manifestations' as 'prostration,' 'ecstasy,' and 'immediate laughter.'"⁵⁰

The interdenominational, but mostly Methodist membership, of the National Holiness Association provided a way for the more extreme perfectionist proponents to further their agendas without the constraints of working through their denomination, which made them more dissatisfied with their

⁵⁰ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 545-53.

denomination, and also made their denomination more dissatisfied with them.

1894. The Southern Methodist Church Statement

The Methodist denomination began to resent the lack of denominational control over all the independent holiness activity in the Association. Methodist theologians and seminaries began to question whether sinless perfection was important, and whether it had really been important to Wesley. In 1894, the Southern Methodist Church issued a statement that made holiness promoters feel there was no longer any hope in redeeming the Methodist denomination, and many new holiness denominations were created.

Synan. In 1894 ... the General Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South [issued a statement,] “There has sprung up among us a party with holiness as a watchword; they have holiness associations, holiness meetings, holiness preachers, holiness evangelists, and holiness property. Religious experience is represented as if it consists of only two steps, the first step out of condemnation into peace and the next step into Christian perfection. The effect is to disparage the new birth, and all stages of spiritual growth from the blade to the full corn in the ear.”⁵¹

1895. Irwin’s Fire-Baptized Holiness Church

Around 1895, Benjamin Irwin, interpreted John Fletcher’s writings, to teach, like Horner, that the

⁵¹ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 386-454.

baptism “with the Holy Ghost and with fire” (Mt. 3:11), was a third work of grace after sinless perfection, rather than part of the second step. Several Wesleyan Methodist Churches left their denomination and became Fire-Baptized Holiness Churches. Fire baptisms included speaking in tongues.

Synan. Irwin [taught] additional “baptisms of fire” ... he named the baptisms of “dynamite,” “lyddite,” and “oxidite.” ... [One woman testified,] “August 1st, 1898, I was pardoned of my sins. On the following Sunday at eleven o’clock, God sanctified me wholly. A few days later I received the Comforter. Later in October, God gave me the Baptism of fire. The devil and all the hosts of hell cannot make me doubt this. ... During services a night or so afterwards, ... I received the Dynamite. A few nights after this I received the definite experience of lyddite.” ... In 1904, William Fuller, who led the black churches in the denomination, wrote ... he [still] praised God for “the blood that cleans up, the Holy Ghost that fills up, the fire that burns up, and the dynamite that blows up.”⁵²

1897. Mason’s Church of God in Christ

In 1897, two Missionary Baptist pastors in Mississippi that had been expelled from their denomination for claiming to have received sinless perfection, C. H. Mason and C. P. Jones, held a holiness revival that eventually became the largest black Pentecostal denomination in world, the Church of God in Christ.

⁵² Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 575-639.

Synan. Like many of the holiness and Pentecostal bodies, the Church of God in Christ owed its existence to a strong and dominating founder. Mason stamped his personality on his church far more emphatically than any other holiness leader. Called by his followers a “Greater than the Apostle Paul.”⁵³

1896. Tomlinson’s Church of God (Cleveland, Tennessee)

In 1896, three Irwin fire-baptized preachers from Tennessee held a revival in the Camp Creek hills of North Carolina. Several who received sinless perfection spoke in tongues, including children. Divine healing was also taught. In 1903, A. J. Tomlinson was invited to lead the group, and accepted after he saw a vision there. In 1907 the new denomination took the name Church of God, and eventually became one of the largest Pentecostal organizations in the U. S.

Synan. The typical fire-baptized prohibitions were imposed, against medicines, meats, candies, and neckties. ... A. J. Tomlinson, ... [was] a mystical Quaker [from a church in Maine] called “The Church of the Living God for the Evangelization of the World, Gathering of Israel, New Order of Things at the Close of the Gentile Age.” ... In the early church “the ... light beamed forth from the Pentecostal chamber.” ... Then intervened the long period of apostasy known as the “dark ages.” ... Now that the true church had been rediscovered in the mountains of North Carolina; “the evening light ... is now shining.” ... Eventually the

⁵³ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle 756-768.

faithful of all denominations in every nation of the world would return to the true church and the Lord would set up his kingdom, beginning at Burger Mountain and ending in Jerusalem, ... all others being part of the “dark ages” of apostasy. ... [Tomlinson] reported that once, at the Union Grove church, people “fell on the floor, and some writhed like serpents,” while others “seemed to be off in a trance for four or five hours.” In all of this the preacher felt that the “church seemed to be greatly edified.” ... These demonstrations attracted large crowds. ... [In 1966 in Jerusalem,] Tomlinson[‘s] ... eldest son Homer, ... [crowned himself] “King of the World.”⁵⁴

1898. Holmes Theological Seminary

N. J. Holmes was a Presbyterian preacher who experienced sinless perfection and started the The Holmes Theological Seminary in Greenville, SC. in 1898. The seminary is associated with the Fire-Baptized Holiness Church, and is the oldest Pentecostal school in the world.⁵⁵

1900. Crumpler’s Pentecostal Holiness Church

A. B. Crumpler was disciplined in the Methodist church for preaching the doctrine of sinless perfection. So he started the Pentecostal Holiness Church in 1900.⁵⁶

Synan. Most of the Southern holiness churches ... belonged to the more “radical” wing of the

⁵⁴ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle 771-860, 3804-3805.

⁵⁵ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle 661-70.

⁵⁶ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle 682-701.

holiness movement emphasizing such new doctrines, as divine healing ... [and] a “third blessing” of “the fire,” ... [and were thus] predisposed to accept the even more radical doctrines of the Pentecostal movement when it began in 1906. ... The “third blessing heresy” of Irwin’s church was destined to become the orthodox position of the southern holiness/Pentecostal groups, with the single addition of speaking in tongues as the evidence of baptism by the Holy Ghost.⁵⁷

Synan. Many of [the new] groups used the term “holiness” in their names, while others preferred the word “Pentecostal.” No other name, however, became as popular as “the Church of God.” Between 1880 and 1923 no less than two hundred groups adopted some version of this name. ... [including] D. S. Warner’s church, which began in 1880 in Anderson, Indiana. ... In general, groups that formed before 1894 belonged to the holiness persuasion and would not identify with the Pentecostal movement after 1906; those beginning after 1894 became Pentecostal later. The greatest sect-forming period in the South was 1894-98, following the anti-holiness policy statement of the General Conference of the Southern Methodist Church.⁵⁸

Synan. The groups were basically Arminian in their theology and Wesleyan in their view of sanctification. ... Coca Cola, chewing gum, rings, bracelets, and earbobs were sinful ... [or] to wear a necktie or attend a county fair. ... Buying life insurance was frowned upon as an indication of lack of faith in God. Divine healing was taught in such a way that it was

⁵⁷ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 725-736.

⁵⁸ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 737-746.

almost placed on a level with the new birth ... [because] physical healing for the body was provided “in the atonement.”⁵⁹

1900. Alexander Dowie

Synan. Alexander Dowie ... gained his greatest fame at the 1893 Chicago World’s Fair, where his healing services vied with Buffalo Bill’s show. ... In 1900, north of Chicago, Dowie founded a community he named Zion City, a place where “doctors, drugs, and devils were not allowed,” ... [having] a wooden tabernacle with seating for 8,000. ... Dowie sent missionaries around the globe ... [and] filled the largest auditoriums in the nation including Madison Square Garden. ... In 1901, Dowie proclaimed himself to be “Elijah the Restorer.” Then, in 1904, he announced that he would “restore apostolic Christianity” now that he was “the first apostle of a renewed end times church.” The next year, after suffering a stroke, he began to lose control of the church he had founded.⁶⁰

Synan. The Church of God ... in Cleveland, Tennessee, [was] under ... Tomlinson, ... the Church of God in Christ, ... in Memphis, ... [was under] ... Mason. The Fire-Baptized Holiness Church ... [was] under ... J. H. King, ... [and] the Pentecostal Holiness Church ... [was under] Crumpler in ... North Carolina. All of these men led small holiness denominations that were practically identical in doctrine and operated in the same general territory. In the spring of 1906 the news reached all of these leaders about ... the Azusa Street Mission. ...

⁵⁹ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 871-877.

⁶⁰ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 884-887.

The southern holiness churches, [were] the only major holiness groups to join the fledgling Pentecostal movement.⁶¹

1900. The Church of the Nazarene

Synan. The largest holiness denomination in America began its history in [Los Angeles] when Phineas Bresee founded the “Church of the Nazarene” there in 1895 ... in his “Peniel Tabernacle.” ... Joseph Smale, ... opened a mission called the “First New Testament Church” at Burbank Hall ... as “a fellowship for evangelical preaching and teaching and Pentecostal life and service.” ... By 1906 each of them preached to more than a thousand people at their Sunday services.⁶²

1904. The Welsh Revival

Synan. Smale, ... in 1904, ... participated in the famous Welsh revival under Evan Roberts ... which had seen over 30,000 conversions and 20,000 new church members. ... A young man attending Pastor Smale’s services was Frank Bartleman ... [who was impressed by] the appearance of “glossolalia,” or speaking with other tongues. ... Young men and women who knew nothing of Old Welsh would in their ecstasy speak in that tongue.”⁶³

1912. H. A. Ironside Criticism

Synan. Perhaps the most damaging broadside was the ... H. A. Ironside[‘s] ... *Holiness, The False and the True*, ... in 1912. The holiness

⁶¹ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 892-901.

⁶² Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 917-923.

⁶³ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 923-946.

churches were described ... as hotbeds of “pharisaism,” “tattling,” “selfishness,” and even frequent immorality. Speaking as a former member of the Salvation Army, Ironside’s book was taken by many critics to discredit the entire movement, becoming a veritable textbook of anti-holiness theology.⁶⁴

1906-1959. The Pentecostal Movement

Why did the Pentecostal movement require a Sinless Perfection movement to precede it? Because it takes a lower level of gullibility to believe oneself and others to be sinlessly perfect, than it does to believe one’s own and others’ babblings to be supernatural. It’s easier to say “your sins are forgiven” or “I’m sinlessly perfect,” which requires no visible change, than to try to imitate audible tongues or visible healings.

Mt. 9:5. Which is easier, to say, “Your sins are forgiven you;” or to say, “Arise, and walk?”

This is why the Pentecostal movement started in the Holiness churches. But why did it spread? Because society in 1900 was far more experiential and less conservative than society in 1800.

1900. Charles Fox Parham

Synan. Parham ... first singled out “glossolalia” ... as the only evidence of having received the baptism of the Holy Ghost ... [and thus] laid the ... foundations of the modern Pentecostal movement. ... [He] had also been in services

⁶⁴ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle 879-882.

with Irwin's Fire-Baptized people and [accepted] the idea of a "third experience" of a "baptism with the Holy Ghost and fire." ... He had traveled to Chicago to hear Alexander Dowie, ... and to Shiloh, Maine, to investigate Frank Sandford's "Holy Ghost and Us" church, ... [and] heard ... several students came down out of a "prayer tower" speaking in tongues. ... His students conducted a watch night service on December 31, 1900. ... After midnight and the first day of the twentieth century ... Miss Ozman reportedly began "speaking in the Chinese language." ... When Parham[s] ... students visited Galena, Kansas, late January, ... [they] spoke in twenty-one known languages, including French, German, Swedish, Bohemian, Chinese, Japanese, Hungarian, Bulgarian, Russian, Italian, Spanish, and Norwegian. ... Parham immediately began to teach that missionaries would no longer be compelled to study foreign languages to preach in the mission fields. ... [In] 1905, he moved his headquarters to Houston, Texas.⁶⁵

1905. William Joseph Seymour

Synan. From 1900 to 1902 Seymour [an African-American] attended classes in Martin Wells Knapp's "God's Bible School" in Cincinnati [where] he joined the "reformation" Church of God, also known as "the Evening Light Saints." ... In 1905 ... [he attended Parham's school in Houston where he] heard the new Pentecostal theology, ... that the holiness movement had been wrong in asserting that sanctification was also the baptism with the Holy Spirit; the latter was a

⁶⁵ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 948-987.

“third experience.” ... Sanctification cleansed ... while the baptism ... brought great power for service. ... No one should be satisfied ... until having spoken with tongues as “proof” that one had received the Holy Ghost. ... While studying under Parham, ... some claimed ... [they] were able to “command the classics of a Homer or talk the jargon of the lowest savage of the African jungle.”⁶⁶

1906. Azusa Street

Synan. Neely Terry, ... a friend of William Seymour [at the school in Houston] later returned to her home in Los Angeles, where she found that her family and some close friends had been excommunicated from the black Second Baptist Church for professing the holiness sanctification experience. Subsequently they organized a small black holiness mission, [and] invite[d] Seymour to come [as an additional] pastor. ... When Seymour preached his first sermon [there] he took as his text Acts 2:4 and declared that speaking in tongues was the “Bible” evidence of receiving the Holy Spirit. ... The Pastor, Mrs. Julia Hutchins, ... of the Southern California Holiness Association, felt that this teaching was contrary to accepted holiness views, and the following night she padlocked the church door to keep Seymour out, ... [who] stay[ed] at the home of one Richard Asbery, ... [and] began to preach in the living room ... located at 214 Bonnie Brae Street, ... until the night of April 9, 1906, when Seymour and seven others fell to the floor ... speaking in tongues. ... News ... spread quickly through the neighborhood as the newly baptized enthusiasts went to the

⁶⁶ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 989-1005.

front porch to conduct their strange services. ... [They moved to] an old abandoned African Methodist Episcopal Church (AME) building at 312 Azusa Street. ... Hundreds and later thousands of people began to flock to the mission ... from ... holiness movements around the country. ... “Elder” Seymour, ... rarely preached and much of the time kept his head covered in an empty packing crate behind the pulpit. At times he would be seen walking through the crowds, ... hurling challenges ... or ... encouraging seekers at the wood plank altars to “let the tongues come forth.” ... By December 1906, ... many other missions ... were beginning to operate in cities all over the United States, as visitors to Azusa Street carried the “fire” to their own homes. ... Spiritualists and mediums from the numerous occult societies of Los Angeles began to attend and to contribute their seances and trances to the services.⁶⁷

1906. Garr and Barratt

Synan. The first white man to receive the experience at Azusa was one A. G. Garr, pastor of a holiness mission in Los Angeles. After his “baptism,” Garr and his wife went to India where they expected to preach to the natives in their own languages. However, when this was attempted, it ended in failure. After their fiasco in India the Garrs traveled to Hong Kong where they set up a mission and learned Chinese in the more conventional manner. ... The Norwegian Methodist pastor T. B. Barratt, ... in November 1906, ... received the Pentecostal experience in New York and soon afterwards returned to Oslo. ... Barratt soon

⁶⁷ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 1009-1076.

had Norwegian Methodists and Baptists speaking in other tongues. ... Spectacular news coverage ... created great crowds. ... He is credited with beginning the Pentecostal movements in Sweden, Norway, Denmark, Germany, France, and England.⁶⁸

Synan. The Pentecostal movement was the child of the holiness movement, which in turn was a child of Methodism. Practically all the early Pentecostal leaders were firm advocates of sanctification as a “second work of grace” and simply added the “Pentecostal baptism” with the evidence of speaking in tongues as a “third blessing.” ... The probability is that thousands more had done the same in the many camp meetings and revivals ... after the Civil War. The ... Azusa Street revival ... acted as the catalyst that congealed tongue-speaking into a fully defined doctrine. ... Parham [preached]: “Now all Christians credit the fact that we are to be recipients of the Holy Spirit, but each have their own private interpretations as to his visible manifestations; some claim shouting, leaping, jumping, and falling in trances, while others put stress upon inspiration, unction and divine revelation.” ... It was precisely this settlement, that tongues were “the” evidence of the reception of the Holy Spirit, that gave Pentecostalism its greatest impetus. It at once solved the problem of proving to one’s self and the world that one had received the experience. Pentecostalism thus succeeded in “doing what the Holiness Movement could not do” in that it offered the believer a “repeatable and unmistakable motor

⁶⁸ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 1091-1124.

expression which, in effect, guaranteed one's possession of the Spirit."⁶⁹

1906. Cashwell

Synan. [One] of Crumpler's [Pentecostal Holiness Church] preachers, Gaston Barnabas Cashwell, of Dunn, North Carolina, ... [travelled to Azusa and] received the Pentecostal experience. ... Returning to his home in Dunn, North Carolina, he rented an old three-story building. ... The Pentecostal meeting he planned would be for the Southeast what Azusa Street had been to the West. Beginning on December 31, 1906, the meeting would result in the conversion of most of the southeastern holiness movement to the Pentecostal view. ... Cashwell had invited all the ministers of the Fire-Baptized Holiness Church, the Pentecostal Holiness Church, and the Free-Will Baptist Church to attend. ... As he traveled through the South from 1906 to 1909, Cashwell established himself firmly as the "Pentecostal apostle to the South." ... His opening volley in every meeting would be, "Come on, preachers, bring your Bibles out." ... In 1909, he ... returned to the Methodist Church, as Crumpler had done before him. But try as he might, he could not undo [the results of] his own brief preaching tour of 1906 through 1908, ... the bringing of three holiness denominations into the Pentecostal movement, a seismic shift.⁷⁰

⁶⁹ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 1128-1198.

⁷⁰ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 1202-1249, 1376-1378.

1908. Absorption of Fire Baptized Holiness Church

Synan. The Pentecostal Holiness Church [merged] with the Fire-Baptized Holiness Church in 1911 since the two denominations operated in practically the same territory and shared the same doctrines after 1906. ... These mergers, which produced the present Pentecostal Holiness Church, illustrated that both the Pentecostal and holiness movements contained strong ecumenical tendencies.⁷¹

Synan. The thousands of holiness devotees remaining in the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, remained largely untouched by the movement. Other leaders, such as A. B. Simpson, head of the Christian and Missionary Alliance, rejected the Pentecostal view. ... In many areas the term “holiness church” would become synonymous in the public mind with Pentecostalism.⁷²

The Church of the Nazarene, the Salvation Army, and the Free Methodists also rejected the Pentecostal view.

1910. Finished Work Controversy

“By 1910, William Durham’s North Avenue Mission in Chicago replaced Azusa Street as the center of the Pentecostal movement.”⁷³ Durham preached a “Finished Work” doctrine, that sanctification occurred at the time of justification, though it was experienced progressively, so brethren could skip

⁷¹ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle 1297-1312.

⁷² Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle .

⁷³ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle .

right from justification to the baptism of the Spirit, without a sanctification experience to prepare the way. Now that Pentecostalism had arrived as the third blessing, the Congregations no longer needed the sanctification second blessing. The problem began as more men from non-Wesleyan backgrounds, like Baptist, converted to Pentecostalism. Most Pentecostal denominations formed after 1911 followed the “finished work” doctrine. About half of Pentecostals are in each camp today.⁷⁴

1914. The Assemblies of God

The Pentecostals that followed the Finished Work doctrine organized the Assemblies of God (AOG) denomination in 1914, led by E. N. Bell, and including H. G. Rodgers with 352 white ministers from the interracial Church of God in Christ, which ended its interracial character. The AOG eventually became the world’s largest Pentecostal denomination.⁷⁵

1916. Jesus Name, Oneness, Pentecostal Unitarians

At camp-meeting, baptismal service in 1913, R. E. McAlister mentioned that the apostles only baptized in Jesus’ name, never in the name of the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit. Hearing that, Frank Ewart, who had succeeded Durham in a Los Angeles ministry, began teaching there was only one personality in the trinity, Father and Holy Spirit describing different aspects of Jesus. Justification, sanctification, and the baptism of the Spirit with

⁷⁴ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle .

⁷⁵ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle .

tongues all occurred at the same time, when, and only when, a person was baptized in Jesus' name, and those baptized any other way were unsaved and needed to be baptized. The Assembly of God general council in 1916 decided on the Trinitarian side, and 156 out of 585 preachers left the denomination, and formed what later became two "oneness" denominations, the mostly white United Pentecostal Church International, which currently has about 5 million people, and the mostly black Pentecostal Assemblies of the World which has about 2 million people. Some small oneness Pentecostal groups practice snake handling. About a fifth of U. S. Pentecostals are oneness Pentecostals.⁷⁶

1946-1955. William Branham (1909-1965)

At his birth in 1909, a "light come whirling through the window, about the size of a pillow, and circled around where I was, and went down on the bed." In 1946, an angel said he would be able to detect diseases by vibrations on his left hand. F. F. Bosworth wrote, "He does not begin to pray for ... the healing line each night, ... until he is conscious of the presence of the Angel with him on the platform. Without this consciousness, he seems to be perfectly helpless." "When the oppressing spirit is cast out in Jesus' Name, you can see Brother Branham's red and swollen hand return return to its normal condition." The Angel told him that the anointing would ... enable him to tell people many of the events of their lives from their childhood down to the present time. The audience hears all this over the public address system. When praying for the sick he would watch the Pillar of fire move

⁷⁶ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle

around the building from one person to another, revealing the “thoughts and intents” of the heart, the past, the present and the future. His sermons were largely stories of his personal experiences. Many of his followers, however, accepted his sermons as oral scripture and referred to his teachings as “The Message.” In 1963, Branham announced he was a prophet with the anointing of Elijah, who had come to herald Christ’s second coming. While his manager had paid personal income taxes on nearly \$80,000 in one year, Branham had claimed only about \$7,000 in that year. Around 1956, he agreed to pay the IRS a penalty of about \$40,000. He worked under the burden of that debt for the remainder of his life, and he left his family with the largest part still unpaid when he died.⁷⁷ A few quotes from Branham: “I was with Moses at the burning bush; I saw the Pillar of Fire; I saw His glory. ... I heard His voice. Don’t try to explain it away from me now, ‘cause I was there. I know what I’m talking about. I seen what happened. Yes, sir!” ... “So I repeat, I sincerely believe and maintain as a private student of the Word, along with divine inspiration that 1977 ought to terminate the World systems and usher in the millennium.” “During that time I saw seven Angels in a form of a pyramid that swept down and picked me up. And I was brought east to open the Seven Seals for God.”

1948. Latter Rain Movement

1948 was an eventful year. Israel was re-established, Billy Graham and Oral Roberts became nationwide celebrities, and the New Order of the Latter Rain movement began after several leaders from the Sharon Orphanage in North Battleford,

⁷⁷ Harrell, *All Things Possible*, 37-40.

Saskatchewan, Canada, visited William Branham's meetings. They believed God would re-establish the offices of apostles and prophets, and some super apostle sons of God that can't die would become manifest, and bring judgment on the Congregation. Every pastor and government official will need to submit to them or be physically destroyed, and they will attain world dominion. They will control prophesy and doctrine, judge the Congregation, and destroy death, because they will actually become Christ incarnate collectively. "[Messiah] must reign, until he has put all enemies under his feet. The last enemy that will be destroyed is death. For [God] has put all things under his feet," 1 Cor. 15:25-27. The Pentecostal denominations condemned their teaching, but many individuals still followed it, and it greatly influenced divine healing ministries, the third wave of independent charismatic Congregations, and the New Apostolic Reformation (NAR), so named by Peter Wagner in 1996.⁷⁸

Rev. 2:1-2. To the angel of the Congregation of Ephesus write, "I know ... how you can't bear them which are evil, and you have tried them which say they are apostles, and are not, and have found them liars."

1952. Full Gospel Business Men's Fellowship (FGBMF)

This organization, started by a rich dairyman, Demos Shakarian, did much to bring the baptism of the Spirit experience and tongues to many who would never have gone to a Pentecostal Congregations.

⁷⁸ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle .

1959-1994. *The Charismatic Movement*

1959. Dennis Bennett's Episcopalian Charismatics

In 1959, Dennis Bennett faced opposition after leading some of his Episcopal Church members in St. Marks in Van Nuys, California, to speak in tongues; so he resigned and was given pastorship of St. Lukes in Seattle, which he turned into a large, tongues-speaking congregation with converts from many different denominations. Up until this time, there had been mostly closet tongues-speakers among traditional denominations. Tongues-speaking within non-Pentecostal denominations has been called the second wave of the Holy Spirit, and termed Charismatic rather than Pentecostal.⁷⁹

1967. Duquesne, Pittsburgh Catholic Charismatics

After 1960, the Catholic Church began declining in the US. in numbers of members, schools, and clergy. Pope John hosted a Vatican II council from 1962-1965 (Vatican I was in 1870), which promoted ecumenicism and which he called a “New Pentecost.” In 1967, two Duquesne University professors led a weekend retreat where David Wilkerson’s, *The Cross and the Switchblade* was required reading, and many were baptized with the Spirit and spoke in tongues. From that time to now, Catholic charismatics have become the largest denominational segment of charismatics worldwide. Charismatic Catholics and priests claim

⁷⁹ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle

charismaticism deepens their devotion to the mass, confession, the rosary, and Mary. Charismatic theologians developed the “organic view” of baptism in the Spirit, in which a person could be baptized in the Spirit at the same time he was baptized by water as a baby, but the evidences, like speaking in tongues, could come later as an adult.⁸⁰

1968. Jesus People

David Wilkerson started Teen Challenge in 1960 and wrote *The Cross and the Switchblade* in 1963. Loren Cunningham also started Youth With a Mission (YWAM) in 1960. Many young people migrated to California under the hippie counter-culture movement, looking for peace and love in a world of nuclear threat and corporate domination. Chuck Smith, a Foursquare pastor in Costa Mesa, California, brought Lonnie Frisbie, a hippie evangelist, into his home in 1968. Thousands of hippies became Jesus People under their ministry. The Calvary Chapel denomination came out of this. Many of the new converts wrote Jesus folk music, and some, like the group “Love Song,” wrote early ‘Christian’ Rock, and released it under Calvary’s “Maranatha! Music” label. Kenn Gulliksen and John Wimber also became Calvary pastors. However, while Chuck Smith led the Calvary Chapel denomination into expository Bible teaching to edify believers as their primary goal, and sought a middle path between fundamentalism and Pentecostalism, Gulliksen left in 1974 to emphasize charismaticism by founding the Vineyard Congregations, and Wimber joined him in 1982, and eventually led the Vineyard.

⁸⁰ Synan, *Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Kindle

1970-1975. Shepherding Ministry

The Fort Lauderdale Five, including Bob Mumford, shared a ministry beginning in 1970 where everyone would have a “covering” shepherd, that would transcend local Congregation and denominational divisions, with the Lauderdale Five at the top, like the Catholic tradition of “spiritual directors.” In 1975, the FGBM refused to allow any of the five to speak at their meetings, and Pat Robertson didn’t allow them to appear on the 700 Club. Such opposition brought an end to the Shepherding ministry by around 1986.

1974. Vineyard Churches

In 1974, Kenn Gulliksen, started a Calvary Chapel Congregation that became the beginning of the Vineyard movement. He brought together Bible studies from the homes of musicians Larry Norman and Chuck Girard that Bob Dylan attended. John Wimber (1934-1997) came to faith in a Quaker church in 1963, and started a Calvary Chapel in 1977, but left in 1982, to join and eventually lead, the Vineyard movement. Wimber eventually wrote a book *Power Evangelism*, which term came from Lonnie Frisby’s ministry, with the idea that signs and wonders were necessary for Pentecost level evangelism and Congregation growth. In 1988, Wimber established relationships with the Mike Bickle and the Kansas City Prophets, Paul Cain and Bob Jones.

1977. Kansas City Conference

In 1977 a conference for Pentecostals and charismatics was attended by four million

Pentecostals and five million charismatics, the majority of which were Catholics.⁸¹ Speakers included Kevin Ranaghan, who led the Catholic Church's Charismatic Renewal Committee, and Catholic Cardinal Leo Suenens. The mixed group sang in tongues and danced before the Lord. Time Magazine reported, "a charismatic time was had by all."

1982. Kansas City Prophets

1982. Mike Bickle, Kansas City Fellowship, IHOP International House of Prayer. Danielson. While visiting Cairo, Egypt [in 1982], Mike Bickle heard the audible voice of the Lord say, "I will change the understanding and expression of Christianity in one generation." God told Bickle to start ... the Kansas City Fellowship (KCF) Congregation. Bickle believed the KC movement had been established by the two resurrection angels which were at Jesus' tomb. He said, "We [KCF] have recognized a mandate from the Lord to make a special commitment to follow the leadership of John Wimber and Paul Cain." In 1990, Ernest Gruen wrote "Documentation of the Aberrant Practices and Teachings of Kansas City Fellowship (Grace Ministries)," exposing Paul Cain and Bob Jones. Wimber took KCF under Vineyard oversight, changing its name to Metro Vineyard Christian Fellowship, and Gruen stopped distributing his document, trusting Wimber to control KCF's abuses. Albert Dager also wrote articles and books to try to expose KCF's errors. Bickle's KCF ministry

⁸¹ Synan, Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition, Kindle

became the International House of Prayer (IHOP) in 1999.⁸²

1975-1991. Bob Jones (1931-2014). Mike Bickle said of Bob Jones, “There is nobody in the natural that had a more integral role in establishing our foundations in that kind of prophetic way, than Bob.” When Jones was 7 years old, and walking on a dirt road in Arkansas, the archangel Gabriel appeared to him on a white horse and blew a double silver trumpet in his face. Jones describes how he went from being a drunkard, fornicator, and bar room brawler, to eventually land in a mental institution, where he was regularly visited by demons who would hold conversations with him. Finally, Jesus Himself told Bob in order to get his mind back, to either kill or forgive twelve people he hated. He claimed he always had three to ten+ visions every night. His hands turned purple in the presence of sin. During one trip to heaven Jesus commissioned him to be one of God’s new generals to lead his end time army. “They themselves will ... put death itself underneath their feet, ... a Church that has reached the full maturity of the god-man!” Wes Campbell told of Bob Jones’ revelation of an upcoming “civil war” in the Congregation. In this war, the blue represents “revelation knowledge” people, fighting for freedom in the Spirit. “The gray” as in gray matter, those bound to their minds, you know, critical thinking. (I’m obviously on the gray side that Jones says is holding back the Congregation.) “There is a ministry after the fivefold called the ministry of PERFECTION, ... coming into the divine nature of Christ.” Jones said the prophetic movement was started by an angel named Emma who is androgynous and appears as female.

⁸² Danielson, Kansas City Prophets.

God told him the general level of prophetic revelation in the Congregation was about 65% accurate at this time. Some are only about 10% accurate, a very few of the most mature prophets are approaching 85% to 95% accuracy. God told him that prophets are like guns and prophecies are like bullets and inaccurate prophecies are like blanks. God said, "I'm loading the guns, I'm putting the blanks in!" God is responsible for inaccurate prophecies. In 1991, Jones was removed from ministering in a Vineyard Congregation after confessing to sexual misconduct with two women. Is. 9:15, "The ancient and honorable, he is the head; and the prophet that teaches lies, he is the tail."⁸³

1996. Rick Joyner (1949-). Rick Joyner. Joyner is a Supreme Council member of "The Knights of Malta" blessed by the Vatican. In 1996 God told Rick Joyner "to begin preparing for ... war." Wes Campbell says God gave Rick Joyner a vision. "Like the American Civil War, the coming spiritual civil war will also be between the Blue and the Gray. In dreams and visions blue often represents heavenly-mindedness - the sky is blue - and gray speaks of those who live by the power of their own minds - the brain is often called gray matter - This will be a conflict between those who may be genuine Christians, but who live mostly according to their natural minds and human wisdom, and those who follow the Holy Spirit." He says the grays are "ruthless and cruel," and must be "confronted and exposed and either converted or removed from their place of influence in the church." After the grays, who he says constitute "nearly half of the believers in the world today," are defeated, there will be "an entirely new definition of

⁸³ <http://letusreason.org/Latrain52.htm>.

1987-2019. Paul Cain (1929-2019). Cain was born into a Pentecostal family. An angel told Paul’s mother to name her son Paul, because he would preach like Paul. At 19, Cain saw an angel with a bright shining sword pointed at a billboard that said Joel’s army was in training. In the 1950’s when Cain was engaged to be married, he was driving his Lincoln when Jesus materialized in the seat next to him and said he was jealous of his fiancé. The Lord said, ‘I walked alone.’ Paul said, ‘If you don’t want me to be married, ... you will have to do something about my feelings.’ The Lord placed his hand on him, and from that day on he never experienced any further sexual desire. John Wimber said Jesus, “physically touched [Cain] on the chest ... and took all sexual desire out of his body [and] for over 40 years he’s lived with no cognizant sense of sexuality.” Kansas City prophet Mike Bickle agreed that when Jesus appeared in the flesh and touched Cain on the chest, “the fire of God went through” him and his “chemistry was changed instantaneously.” From that hour on, Cain has not been aware of a single “romantic or sensual thought.” Wimber later acknowledged that Cain had become involved “with a woman I think in Scandinavia.”

Cain said William Branham was “the greatest prophet that ever lived in ... any of the generations of revival I’ve lived through.” Cain used to work with Branham, and the angel of the Lord instructed Branham to let Cain take over some of his largest crusades. Sexual impropriety caused Cain to go into seclusion for twenty-five years. During these silent

⁸⁴ Hanegraaff, *Counterfeit Revival*, 169-171.

years, the Lord promised him he would be “called to initiate the end time ministry.” In 1987, “The KCF eldership instantly felt the Lord prompting them to make a deep and permanent commitment to serve Paul Cain in any way possible for the rest of his days as the Lord permitted.” Bickle said Cain was a “Samuel looking for David.” Cain predicted a local earthquake would occur when he arrived at the Vineyard in December 1988, and supposedly one did. In February 1989, he stood in Wimber’s pulpit and announced, “I have found that leader [Wimber] that’s going ... to usher in a new move of God, a new wave.” According to Bickle, Jones was the prophet God used to confirm Cain’s selection of Wimber as the leader who would usher in the new wave and introduce to the body of Messiah the apostles that were yet to come in the nineties.⁸⁵

Bob Jones said Cain is “the most anointed prophet that’s in the world today.” Wimber said, “he’s interacting in two dimensions continually. He’s not only seeing you and talking to you, but he’s hearing from God constantly. ... [He will] be in one room and be listening to the conversation of people in another place at the same time.” Cain used to call out the names, addresses, birthdays, and relatives names, of people in the audience with accuracy. In 1995, Cain said, “For quite a while I have been embarrassed to say anything about the latter rain. ... But I don’t care what they think any more... I believe we are going to have the latter rain and I am looking forward to it.” Cain said, “Joel’s army is also in the New Testament. It’s referred to as “the manchild,” Rev. 12:25. God is offering a “greater privilege than was ever offered to any people of any generation at any time from Adam clear down through the end of

⁸⁵ Hanegraaff, *Counterfeit Revival*, 163-7.

the millennium. ... You're gonna ... become that glory." "God has invited us to have a role in establishing a new order of Christianity. ... Beware lest old order brethren rob you and steal this hope from you." "If you don't think I am anointed that just shows you how the devil has fooled you." In 2005, Cain had leave the ministry because of homosexuality and public drunkenness. He reentered the ministry in 2007, and died in 2019.

When did the apostles and prophets of the Bible do things like this? Did Peter or Paul's hands vibrate, swell, or turn colors? Did they follow a pillar of fire like Branham's move around the building from one person to another so they could shout out their names and addresses? You can read more about the latter rain, the Kansas City Prophets, the NAR, and later 'prophets,' like Todd Bentley and Benny Hinn, at <http://letusreason.org>.

1990. Promise Keepers

Oppenheimer. James Ryle [board member co-founder] is PK Coach McCartneys [founder, 1990] pastor. So we can now see the Vineyard PK connection. ... Mike Timmis a Roman Catholic PK board member [prayed in] 1997 at a PK gathering in Washington, D.C., ... "We recognize that we do have doctrinal differences ... but, Father, we will not let these differences destroy our unity. ... Dave Hunt points out in his Berean newsletter, in Atlanta, Georgia, PK gathered 39,000 pastors. The conference brought together representatives of the apostate World Council of Churches and National Council of Churches, evangelicals, Mormons and Roman Catholics, including 600 priests. ... Speaking at a clergy conference

in St. Petersburg, Florida, on February 19, attended by over than 3,000 pastors and church members, McCartney said that God told him to say that “every church that names the name of Jesus is supposed to give Promise Keepers \$1,000.” (Steve Persall, “McCartney appeals for church donations.” The Denver Post, Feb. 20. 1998). ... “I think we’re going to have another St. Valentine’s Day massacre. I think Almighty God is going to rip open the hearts of our leaders. ... And I THINK HE’S GOING TO PUT THEM BACK TOGETHER AGAIN AS ONE. ONE LEADERSHIP. WE’VE GOT TO HAVE ONE LEADERSHIP, ONE LEADERSHIP ONLY” (Bill McCartney, Promise Keepers, Detroit Silver Dome, April 29, 1995). Who will run this one leadership pray, tell? ... The Church was never organized to have one leadership over the whole Church as in the Roman Catholic order, but a plurality of elders throughout local bodies.⁸⁶

1992-1977. Lakeland, Toronto Blessing, Brownsville

In 1992, Rodney Howard-Browne led meetings in Lakeland, Florida, characterized by outbreaks of ‘holy laughter.’ Holy laughter and animal sounds became even more famous at a 1993 revival at a Vineyard-associated Congregation at the Toronto airport that saw 600,000 new visitors from around the world by 1995. John Wimber expelled the Congregation from Vineyard association. It was followed in 1995 by a similar experience at Brownsville Assemblies of God in Pensacola, Florida which 1,600,000 persons had attended by

⁸⁶ <http://www.letusreason.org/Pent32.htm>

1994-2020. The Apostles and Prophets Movement

Also called the neo-charismatic movement, the river, post-denomination era, and other names. The focus has moved more to independent Congregations, and to mega- Congregations via the Church Growth Movement.

Here's a list of some large mega-churches and their membership count as of March 2019.

Seoul, South Korea: Yonggi Cho Yoido Full Gospel, 800,000.

Hyderabad, India: Calvary Temple, 250,000.

Abidjan, Ivory Coast based: Works & Mission Baptist, 185,000.

Lagos, Nigeria: Deeper Christian Life, 180,000.

Kumuyi Lagos, Nigeria: Deeper Chr. Life Ministry, 120,000.

Houston, TX: Lakewood Church, 43,500.

Edmond, OK based: Life Church 41,000.

South Barrington, IL: Willow Creek Comm. Church, 25,700.

Houston, TX: Second Baptist Church, 23,700.

Lake Forest, CA: Saddleback Church, 22,000.⁸⁷

1994. New Apostolic Reformation (NAR)

In 1982, Peter Wagner (1930-2016) and John Wimber (1934-1997) taught a Signs and Wonders and Church Growth class together at Fuller Theological. Wagner continued to be Professor of

⁸⁷ <http://kirche-u30.de/en/10-largest-churches-worldwide>, 8/20/19.

Church Growth there until 2001. He taught “spiritual mapping,” which includes finding out the names of demons that rule certain areas and releasing angels against them. He also teaches seven-mountain dominionism.

He created the New Apostolic Reformation (NAR) name in 1994, which is a hierarchical network like the Shepherding Movement, but which has escaped attack, unlike the Shepherding Movement, possibly because everyone who could attack is already in a good position near the top of the NAR.

Hanley. Peter Wagner insisted that the NAR is not an organization, has no top leader, no team and no annual meeting. However, this is completely misleading and factually incorrect. Yes, there is no organization called the NAR with a president, a board and an annual meeting. However, there is an elaborate structure, carefully engineered by Wagner and his colleagues which they call the “new wineskin.” This structure looks organic and fluid, but is highly organized and sophisticated -- as though it were designed by someone with high-level marketing skills. The wording is carefully crafted to appear and sound non-controlling or threatening, and Wagner admitted this many times. There is an above ground structure with strict membership and dues, and there is an underground structure which operates under the radar and establishes teachings, goals and strategies. Instead of boards, they have “councils” and “roundtables” that meet frequently, and a secret, private “inner circle” of apostles and prophets that are “covenanted” together. Each apostle and network is submitted to and under the covering of an apostle in the inner circle

who is submitted to the “presiding apostle.” However, they avoid the word “submission” and “covering” and instead speak of being “accountable” and “aligned.”⁸⁸

The NAR focuses attention mostly on prophets, probably because a person can join up and become a prophet, but the office of apostle is reserved, and the identities of those who are apostles are kept secret for now, to avoid upsetting those who missed out. In a vision by Rick Joyner, who is an NAR prophet and probably also an apostle (who knows?), the eagles “are the hidden prophets who have been kept for this hour.”⁸⁹ Wagner was the top leader until 2010, when he resolved all future leadership transfer issues by putting a corporation, Global Spheres, Inc. (GSI) at the top, and then putting Chuck Pierce at the head of GSI.

GSI. All believers should be under the care of a ... pastor who has secured proper apostolic alignment. GSI is an apostolic network which provides proper alignment to leaders, [apparently to the highest echelon of new apostles who everyone else is aligned under].⁹⁰

One NAR member, Steve Shultz, created the Elijah List website in 1997 with 280,000 subscribers as of 2018 to transmit fresh daily prophetic ‘manna’ from the Lord, regarding the days in which we live.

⁸⁸ Hanley, *They Call Themselves Apostles*, 848-855.

⁸⁹ Philpott, *The New Apostolic Reformation, 1773-1774*.

⁹⁰ Hanley, *They Call Themselves Apostles*, 1188, quoting GSI website.

Apparently, it's never fun to be at the bottom of a pyramid, so now the Independent Network Charismatic (INC) has also been set up.

Christerson. Peter Wagner, ... a highly influential INC leader himself, has coined the term the “New Apostolic Reformation” (NAR) to describe many of the leaders and ministries that we are calling Independent Network Charismatic. Wagner began to develop relationships with leaders whom he saw as apostles and formed two “apostolic networks”: Eagle Vision Apostolic Team (EVAT) [vertical] and the International Coalition of Apostles (ICA) [horizontal under EVAT]. Wagner until recently led EVAT, which has twenty-five members. ... The ICA is a larger group of 400 apostles who also meet annually and pay dues [like they do in the NAR]. ... Wagner [gave] leadership of the WLI [Wagner Leadership Institute] to Che Ahn. He handed off leadership of the ICA to apostle John Kelly, and Chuck Pierce leads ... Global Spheres [and thus EVAT]. The WLI is perhaps the largest and best-organized promoter of INC teachings. It describes itself as an “international network of apostolic training centers.”... [It's] taught by high-profile INC leaders such as Che Ahn, Bill Johnson, Chuck Pierce, Randy Clark, and Cindy Jacobs. Wagner and his apostles teach that the kingdom of God can and will be founded on earth through the rise of apostles who will establish themselves as leaders in the “Seven Mountains of Culture”: religion, education, family, media, arts and entertainment, and business. They also assert that Christian believers will soon be the recipients of “the largest transfer of wealth in the history of

mankind,” which they will use to bring about the transformation of the world.⁹¹

1996. Bethel Church, Redding

Oppenheimer. Bill Johnson, pastor of Bethel Church [since 1996] is leading the charismatic charge with signs and wonders. ... Using Yoga and contemplative prayer from ancient monks and various other new age techniques, speaking of contacting and waking up angels for a new revival. We have the first new age hybrid church.⁹²

2012. Judy Franklin & Ellyn Davis. The Physics of Heaven

Judy Franklin, author, is administrative assistant to Bill Johnson. Kris Vallotton, Senior Associate Leader of Bethel Church, wrote the forward. Pastor Bill Johnson and his wife Beni wrote four chapters. Jonathan Welton, who wrote *The School of Seers: A Practical Guide on How to See in The Unseen Realm* wrote one chapter. Seers and unseen realms are becoming quite popular.

2012. Franklin. *The Physics of Heaven.* The zero-point field ... is an “underlying sea of quantum light,” and it will turn out that we can obtain power from it to do far more than Jesus did during His earthly ministry. [Franklin] believes that this energy is in us and around us and is the real power of God [749]. [Per] Bill Johnson, “We can’t just camp around old truth, but should seek newly revealed truth for our generation” [730]. Welton ... reasons that, if there is a counterfeit, there must be the

⁹¹ Christerson, Network Christianity, 8, 31.

⁹² <http://www.letusreason.org/DVDBethel%20or%20Ichabod.htm>

genuine article. So then, he says, look into the counterfeit to find the truth. Mine the counterfeit, dig deep, search it out, and there will be truths as well as the counterfeit. He claims that the devil stole from God what we call the occult but that Christians should now reclaim these lost arts. Just like that! And Bill Johnson, Kris Vallotton, and the rest simply swallow it [736-738]. [Davis says that after she] moved to Sedona, “I was intrigued by what I found there. I saw healings and mystical experiences and revelation to rival anything I had seen or experienced in the church. . . . It wasn’t that I wanted to become a New Ager, I just wanted to find out if maybe they had uncovered some truths the church hadn’t.” ... God is “moving on” into quantum mysticism, which is “unfamiliar territory that seems dangerous and sometimes seems to contradict what He’s done in the past” [775-778, 785-786]. Kris Vallotton, Bill Johnson, Jonathan Welton, and others (the predominant NAR notables) ... “all agree that the next move of God will cause a shift at the deepest level of who we are - perhaps at the very ‘vibrational level’ that the New Age movement has been exploring” [788-789]. [Johnson] is convinced that “realms are opening up right now to people because ... God has ... given them access to hidden things” [828-829, this sounds like Gnosticism]. Welton assures his readers that “I have found throughout Scripture at least 75 examples of things that the New Age has counterfeited, such as having a spirit guide, trances, meditation, auras, power objects, clairvoyance, clairaudience, and more. These actually belong to the church, but they have been stolen and cleverly repackaged. ... When you see a counterfeit, don’t shrink back in fear

- let this cry rise in your heart, "THAT IS MINE,
AND I WANT IT BACK!" [865-867].

Whether it's new age channeling of messages from ascended masters, or using healing angels, or ascending ourselves into the ascendosphere; or whether it's charismatic becoming the manifest sons of god, and releasing or using visiting angels, or being a seer into unseen realms; it's the experience that proves it's true, and the Bible is a hindrance.

2020. Caravan of Unity

Unity Earth is coordinating two Caravans of Unity in 2020. One will travel from the Grace Cathedral in San Francisco on 8/28 and arrive at New York on 9/21 to celebrate the International Day of Peace on 9/21. At the same time, another will be moving from Rumi's tomb in central Turkey to London. Unity Earth and its partners are holding a Toronto Convergence gathering on October 31 the day before the Parliament of the World's Religions, by invitation only to leaders whose life's work is dedicated to a successful transition to the next stage of spiritual evolution. The objective here is broad, positive public impact. Music without words and dance, seven major musical transformative events along the route, is the method of bringing the world together. All Unity. All experience. No words, doctrine, or logic that could cause disagreements or divisions.

20??-20??. The Apostacy

In 2000, Nobel prize winner, John Fogel, wrote "The Fourth Great Awakening and the Future of

Egalitarianism,” in which he said American society is spiraling upwards to greater egalitarianism. In contrast to Fogel’s rosy picture, in a 2001 journal article, John Carpenter, says the so-called “Great Awakenings” were revivals attempts that failed to stem the decline of evangelicalism.

Whereas Fogel said the First Great Awakening weakened predestination and increased egalitarian benevolence, Carpenter says it scattered the Puritan hegemony to Baptists, the New Divinity, and the non-New Divinity groups.

Whereas Fogel said the Second Great Awakening furthered egalitarian abolition and women’s suffrage, Carpenter says it was soon followed by the evangelical loss of Yale and Andover (which itself had been an evangelical replacement for an earlier lost Harvard).

Whereas Fogel saw the Third Great Awakening as making egalitarian gains for labor and civil rights, Carpenter says Dwight L. Moody and Billy Sunday functioned more as an evangelical strategic retreat than a great awakening, and that the Pentecostal explosion was more religious than evangelical.

And finally, Carpenter sees a current Fourth Apostasy as being more behavioral, with fornication, homosexuality, and abortion being acceptable.⁹³

I see the so-called “Great Awakenings” as the downward progression of the Charismatic/New Age apostasy. In the First Great Awakening, bodily manifestations became accepted along with the

⁹³ Carpenter, *Cycling Upwards or Spiraling Downwards*.

revival work, though as “no part of the work ... itself.”⁹⁴

In the Second Great Awakening, many Methodists and others deluded themselves into thinking they were sinlessly perfect.

In the Third Great Awakening, those who had already deluded themselves into believing they were sinlessly perfect, then deluded themselves, and much of the world, into thinking they were speaking in Pentecostal tongues.

In The Fourth Great Awakening, the Charismatics deluded themselves into thinking they exercised the gifts of the Spirit, including prophecy and divine healing.

The Fifth Great Awakening will be the end of true, born-again faith as the Congregation is taken out of the world at the rapture, and all religions will comfortably fellowship in religious, new age, outward manifestations without doctrinal differences being of any importance. The only uncomfortable part for them will be the 144,000 believing Jewish missionaries (Rev. 7:3-8), the multitudes truly saved (Rev. 7:9), and the two prophets during the 7-year tribulation period.

Rev. 11:3-10. I will give power to my two witnesses, and they shall prophesy a thousand two hundred and sixty days. ... And when they shall have finished their testimony, the beast ... shall overcome them, and kill them. ... And they that dwell on the earth shall rejoice over them, and make merry, and shall send gifts one

⁹⁴ Tracy, The Great Awakening, 278.

to another; because these two prophets tormented them that dwelt on the earth.

Why do I think the progression of the apostacy from the time immediately following the death of the twelve apostles up until the antichrist, and the main path of the Great Awakenings, proceeds through the Pentecostal and Charismatic movements? Because of the sheer numbers in the growth of these movements in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries.

All through the successive movements, that built one upon another - the mystics, the Let Go and Let God higher lifers, the sinless perfectionists, the Pentecostals, the Charismatics, the new prophets and new age movements - we see a self-centered, quest for power, like Satan's original quest for power.

Is. 14:13-14. *I* will ascend into heaven. *I* will exalt my throne above the stars of God. *I* will sit also on the mountain of the congregation, in the sides of the north. *I* will ascend above the heights of the clouds. *I* will be like the most High.

And along with their quest for personal power, they feel a dissatisfaction with the truly supernatural, but boring, Word of God, and quiet fruit of the Spirit.

1 Tim. 2:15. Study to show yourself approved to God, a workman that doesn't need to be ashamed, rightly dividing the word of truth.

Gal. 5:19-22. Combining Various Versions with the KJV as the Base. The works of the flesh are ... magic-show religion [MSG], ...

jealousy [NIV], ... selfish ambition [NIV], ... heresies, envy; ... but the fruit of the Spirit is love, joy, peace, longsuffering, gentleness, goodness, faith, meekness, temperance.

There is not simply a progression from mysticism, to let go and let God and higher life, to sinless perfectionism, to charismaticism, to new age unity; but even doctrines and denominations that aren't directly on their path, have been leavened by each successive doctrine. So now we have fundamental Baptist Congregations, for example, where everyone believes you have to listen for direct revelation from God's still small voice via inner impressions to know his will, as if they were new age charismatics.

Mt. 13:4-33; 16:12. Some seeds fell by the way side, and the birds came and ate them up. ... When any one hears the word of the kingdom, and doesn't understand it, then the wicked one [the birds are interpreted to represent Satan] comes, and catches away that which was sown in his heart. This is he which received seed by the way side. ... The kingdom of heaven is like a grain of mustard seed, which ... becomes a tree [abnormal growth], so that the birds [interpreted to be Satan above] of the air come and lodge in the branches of it. ... The kingdom of heaven is like leaven, which a woman [biblically not supposed to be teaching doctrine] took, and hid in three measures of meal, till the whole was leavened. ... Beware of the leaven ... of the doctrine of the Pharisees and of the Sadducees.

Wayne Grudem, in 1999, said ...

Grudem. "Christ loved the church and gave himself up for her, that he might sanctify her,

having cleansed her by the washing of water with the word, that he might present the church to himself ... without spot or wrinkle, ... holy and without blemish” (Eph 5:25–27). Throughout history ... sometimes that process of purification has been marked by specific historical events; for example, in 325 and 381, the Nicene Creed; ... in the 19th century, the growing consensus that slavery is wrong and must be abolished. ... The long-term pattern has not been nineteen centuries of decline in the purity and doctrinal and ethical understanding of the Church, but rather a pattern of gradual and sometimes explosive increase in understanding and purity.⁹⁵

I don't think Grudem can be right on this, because it would contradict the parable of the leaven, that in this period before the Messianic Kingdom is set up, all doctrine will become leavened. Messiah has already, past tense, sanctified the Congregation at the beginning, “having [already] cleansed her by the washing of water with the word” (Eph. 5:26), and her continuing faith and love in the midst of growing darkness, confusion, and leavened doctrine is a testimony to Messiah's keeping power.

1 Tim. 4:1. Now the Spirit says expressly, that in the latter times, some will depart from the faith, giving heed to seducing spirits, and doctrines of devils, speaking lies in hypocrisy.

When the antichrist comes and deceives the world (Rev. 13-14), it won't be by logically discussing biblical doctrine, but by a false prophet performing miracles.

⁹⁵ Grudem, *The Bible Alone*.

2 Ths. 2:2-15. The day of Messiah ... will not come, unless there comes a falling away first, and that man of sin be revealed, the son of perdition, who ... exalts himself above all that is called God, ... so that he as God sits in the temple of God, showing himself that he is God. ... Whose coming is after the working of Satan with all power and signs and lying wonders, and with all deceivableness. ... God shall send them strong delusion [by allowing deceitful miracles], so that they will believe a lie, that they all might be damned who believed not the [boring doctrinal] truth. ... But ... God has from the beginning chosen you to salvation through ... belief of the [boring] truth. Whereto he called you by our gospel [not miracles], to the obtaining of the glory of our Lord Jesus Messiah. Therefore, brethren, stand fast, and hold the traditions which you have been taught [not the miracles by which you've been mesmerized], whether by word [not experience], or our [boring] epistle.

Rev. 13:11-18; 19:20. I saw another beast coming up out of the earth, and he had two horns like a lamb, but he spoke like a dragon. ... And he does great wonders, so that he makes fire come down from heaven on the earth in the sight of men [Wow, exciting!], and deceives them that dwell on the earth by the means of those miracles which he had power to do. ... And he had power to give life to the image of the beast [Wow!], so that the image of the beast would both speak [Wow! Wow!], and cause that as many as would not worship the image of the beast would be killed [God help us]. And he caused all ... to receive a mark in their right hand or in their foreheads. ... And the beast was taken, and with him the false prophet that worked miracles before him, with which he

deceived them that had received the mark of the beast, and them that worshipped his image. These both were cast alive into a lake of fire burning with brimstone.

Bibliography



b. Paul's Calling (1876). Domenico Morelli (1823-1901)

Allen, David L.. *Lukan Authorship of Hebrews (New American Commentary Studies in Bible and Theology)*. (B&H Publishing Group). Kindle Edition.

BibleStudy.org. "Asia - Galatia - Bithynia." <https://biblestudy.org/roman-empire/roman-provinces-in-new-testament/asia-galatia-bithynia.html>. Accessed 8/26/2019.

Bixby, Howard L. "Hearing the Call - A Mandate for Ministry." *Journal of Ministry and Theology* 2, no. 1 (1998): 58-65.

Bohannon, John S. "Church-Planting Teams: A Proposed New Hermeneutic for Church-

- Planting Strategy.” *Faith and Mission* 22, no. 2 (2005): 35-45.
- Bruce, F. F. *The Book of Acts (New International Commentary on the New Testament)*. (Eerdmans Publishing Co, 1988). Kindle Edition.
- Carson, D. A. *Showing the Spirit: A Theological Exposition of 1 Corinthians 12–14* (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1987).
- Carpenter, John B.. “The Fourth Great Awakening Or Apostasy: Is American Evangelicalism Cycling Upwards Or Spiraling Downwards?” *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 44:4 (December 2001): 647.
- Casson, Lionel. *Speed Under Sail of Ancient Ships. Transactions of the American Philological Association*. Vol. 82 (1951), pp136-148.
- Calvin, John. *Calvin's Complete Commentaries*. (E4 Group.) Kindle Edition.
- *Response to Questions and Objections of a Certain Jew*. Translated by Clement Pulaski.
- Copeland, Kenneth. “Take Time to Pray.” *Believer's Voice of Victory* (Feb. 1987):9.
- Christerson, Brad. *The Rise of Network Christianity (Global Pentecost Charismatic Christianity)*. (Oxford University Press.) Kindle Edition.
- Chrysostom, John. *Homilies Against The Jews*.
- Danielson, Mary. *The Perfect Storm of Apostasy: An introduction to the Kansas City Prophets and other Latter-Day Prognosticators*. (Lighthouse Trails Publishing.) Kindle Edition.
- Doctrine and Covenants, Section 9.
- Doolittle, Benjamin, *An Enquiry into Enthusiasm: Being an Account What It Is, the Original, Progress, and Effects of It*. (Boston, Rogers & Fowle, 1743).

- Edwards, B. B.. "Introduction To The Pastoral Epistles." *Bibliotheca Sacra*. (008:30, Apr 1851).
- Edwards, Jonathan. *The Revival Writings of Jonathan Edwards: Account of the Revival of Religion, A Faithful Narrative, Distinguishing Marks of a Work of the Spirit of God, Thoughts Concerning the Present Revival*. Kindle Edition.
- John Ellicott, Charles. *Ellicott's Bible Commentary for English Readers*. Kindle Edition. (Patristic Publishing, 2019).
- Eusebius. *The Ecclesiastical History of Eusebius Pamphilus*.
- Another Letter of Constantine,
- Freeman, Hal. "The Great Commission and the New Testament: An Exegesis of Matthew 28:16–20." *Southern Baptist Journal of Theology* 1, no. 4 (1997), 14-20.
- Frey, Joseph Samuel Christian Frederick. *Narrative of the Rev. Joseph Samuel C. F. Frey*. (Unknown.) Kindle Edition.
- Friesen, Garry. *Decision Making and the Will of God: A Biblical Alternative to the Traditional View*. (The Crown Publishing Group, 1980, 2004). Kindle Edition.
- Gager , Jr., John. *Who Made Early Christianity? (American Lectures on the History of Religions)*. (Columbia University Press.) Kindle Edition.
- Goosen, Hugh. "Perceiving God's Voice: Divine Guidance For Everyday Believers." *Conspectus* 19, no. 1 (2015): 2-25.
- Griffiths, Michael C. *Who Really Sends the Missionaries?* (Chicago: Moody, 1974).

Gromacki, Gary. "Preaching the Gospel in Acts and Today." *Journal of Ministry and Theology* 20, no. 2 (2016): 77-131.

Grudem, Wayne. "Do We Act As If We Really Believe That 'The Bible Alone ... Is The Word Of God Written'?" *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 43, no. 1 (2000): 5-26.

..... *Are Miraculous Gifts for Today?: 4 Views (Counterpoints: Bible and Theology)*. (Zondervan, 2011). Kindle Edition.

Johnson, Arthur L. *Faith Misguided: Exposing the Dangers of Mysticism*. (Moody Press, Chicago, 1988). Kindle Edition.

Hanegraaff, Hank. *Counterfeit Revival*. (Thomas Nelson). Kindle Edition.

Harrell, David Edwin, Jr.. *All Things Are Possible* (Indiana University Press). Kindle Edition.

Hanley, PJ. *They Call Themselves Apostles: How Revival Churches Have Been Hijacked by the New Apostolic Reformation*. (Banner of Love Ministries). Kindle Edition.

Hagin, Kenneth E. *The Glory of God*. (Tulsa, Okla.: Faith Library, 1987).

Hemer, Colin J. "The Speeches Of Acts." *Tyndale Bulletin* 40, no. 2 (1989). 277-85.

Horder, William Garrett. *The Poets' Bible*. (Ward, Lock & Bowden, 1895).

Hornok, Ken. "Does God Give Subjective Revelation Today? The Place of Mysticism in Christian Decision Making." *Journal of the Grace Evangelical Society* 20, no. 38 (2007): 15-30.

Huffman, Douglas S. *How Then Should We Choose?: Three Views on God's Will and Decision Making*. (Kregel Publications, 2009). Kindle Edition.

Ignatius of Antioch, *Epistle to the Magnesians*.

- Janeway, Brian. "Is The Acts Of The Apostles Historically Reliable? Part 2 of 2." *Chafer Theological Seminary Journal*, 05:2 (Apr 1999).
- Joubert, Callie; Maartens, Nick. "The Use Of The Bible As A Source Of Divine Guidance On Matters Which It Does Not Directly Address: Is It Scriptural?". *Conspectus* 24:1 (September 2017) p. 105.
- Kinman, Brent. "Pilate's Assize And The Timing Of Jesus' Trial." *Tyndale Bulletin* 42:2 (NA 1991).
- Kvalbein, H. "Go Therefore and Make Disciples'.. . The Concept of Discipleship in the New Testament," *Themelios* 13 (1988) 48-53.
- Liefeld, Walter L. *Interpreting the Book of Acts* (Guides to New Testament Exegesis). (Baker Publishing Group, 1995). Kindle Edition.
- Longenecker, Richard N.. *Acts (The Expositor's Bible Commentary)*. (Zondervan.) Kindle Edition.
- *Paul, Apostle of Liberty*. (Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co.). Kindle Edition.
- Luter, A. Boyd. "Deep and Wide: Education Overflowing as Evangelism from Ephesus." *Faith and Mission* 19, no. 1 (2001): 34-46.
- Luther, Martin. *On the Jews & Their Lies (Annotated)* Eulenspiegel Press. Kindle Edition.
- MacArthur, John F. Jr. "Does God Still Give Revelation?" *Masters Seminary Journal* 14. no. 2 (2003). 217-234.
- *Found: God's Will (John MacArthur Study)*. (David C. Cook, 1973, 2012). First edition published under the title *God's Will Is Not Lost*.

Macgregor, Malcolm. *Christian Freedom: The Baird Lecture, 1913*.

Merkle, Benjamin L. "The Need for Theological Education in Missions: Lessons Learned from the Church's Greatest Missionary." *Southern Baptist Journal of Theology* 9, no. 4 (2005): 50-9.

Michael, Robert. *Holy Hatred: Christianity, Antisemitism, and the Holocaust*. (Palgrave Macmillan, 2006).

Morgan, Timothy C. "Jabez Author Quits Africa. Disappointments Prompt Early Retirement." February 1, 2006. <http://www.christianitytoday.com/ct/2006/february/8.76.html>, accessed 10/10/2017.

Nanos, Mark D.. *Paul within Judaism*. (Fortress Press). Kindle Edition.

Philpott, Kent. *False Prophets Among Us: A Critical Analysis of the New Apostolic Reformation*. (Earthen Vessel Publishing.) Kindle Edition.

Pope Eugene IV. *Papal Bull, Council of Florence 1441*.

Murray, George W. "Paul's Corporate Evangelism in the Book of Acts." *Bibliotheca Sacra* 155, no. 618 (1998): 189-90.

Ramsay, W. M. *St. Paul the Traveller and the Roman Citizen*. (Albion Press, 2016). Kindle Edition.

..... *The Bearing of Recent Discovery on the Trustworthiness of the New Testament*. (Primedia eLaunch). Kindle Edition.

Redlich, E. Basil. *S. Paul and His Companions*, (Macmillan and Co., 1913).

Robinson, Haddon W. *Decision Making By the Book*. (Discovery House Publishers, 1991). Kindle Edition.

- Ryrie, Charles C. *Balancing the Christian Life: 25th Anniversary Edition*. (Moody Publishers, 1969, 1994). Kindle Edition.
- Sanday, William. *Romans (International Critical Commentary)*. Kindle Edition.
- Stutzman, Linford. *Sailing Acts: Following An Ancient Voyage*. (Good Books, 1973, 1984). Kindle Edition.
- Shirer, Priscilla. *Discerning the Voice of God*. Moody Publishers. Kindle Edition.
- Smith, James. *The Voyage and Shipwreck of St. Paul: With Dissertations on the Life and Writings of St. Luke, and the Ships and Navigation of the Ancients*. (Longmans, 1880).
- Smith, William. *A Dictionary of Greek and Roman Antiquities*. Kindle Edition.
- Sproul, R. C. *Can I Know God's Will? (Crucial Questions Series Book 4)*. (Reformation Trust Publishing, 1984, 2010). Kindle Edition.
- Stewart, David Dale. *Memoir of the life of James Haldane Stewart*. Kindle Edition.
- Stonehouse, N. B. The Areopagus Address, The Tyndale New Testament Lecture in the Divinity School, Cambridge, on, July 13, 1949. <http://www.thedivineconspiracy.org/Z3207B.pdf>. Accessed 10/10/2017.
- Stott, John. *The Message of Acts (The Bible Speaks Today Series)*. (InterVarsity Press, 2014). Kindle Edition.
- Swavely, Dave. *Decisions, Decisions. How (and How Not) to Make Them*. (P & R Publishing, 2003).
- Tacitus, Publius Cornelius. *The Annals*. Book 13 (A.D. 54-58) [13.1],
- Tozer, A. W. *The Set of the Sail*. (Moody Publishers, 1986, 2010). Kindle Edition.

Tracy, Joseph. *The Great Awakening ... in the time of Edwards and Whitefield*. Counted Faithful. Kindle.

Unger, Merrill F. "Archaeology and Paul's Campaign at Philippi." *Bibliotheca Sacra* 119, no. 474 (1962): 150-60.

Waltke, Bruce K. *Finding the Will of God: A Pagan Notion?* (Vision House Publishing, 1995). Kindle Edition.

Wenstrom, William E. Jr. "Epaphroditus," <http://wenstrom.org/downloads/written/people/new/epaphroditus.pdf>. Accessed 2/28/2020.

White, Joel. "The Imprisonment that Could Have Happened ...: A Response to Ben Witherington." *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* (61:3, Sept. 2018).

Wikipedia, "Divination," <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divination>, accessed 11/13/2017.

..... "Enthusiasm," <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Enthusiasm>, accessed 10/10/2017.

..... "Interior Lines," https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Interior_lines, accessed 10/10/2017.

..... "Pythia," <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pythia>, accessed 10/10/2017.

..... "New Perspective on Paul," https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/New_Perspective_on_Paul, acc. 11/29/19.

Willard, Dallas. *Hearing God: Developing a Conversational Relationship with God*. (InterVarsity Press, 2012). Kindle Edition.

- Wilson, Clifford. "The Doctor Who Wrote History." *Bible and Spade* (Second Run). BSPADE 02:2 (Spring 1989).
- Wilson, Mark. "Cilicia: The First Christian Churches in Anatolia." *Tyndale Bulletin* 54, no. 1 (2003): 15-30.
- Worth, Roland H. Jr.. *The Seven Cities of the Apocalypse and Roman Culture*. (Wipf and Stock, 1999).
- Wright, N. T.. *Paul*. (HarperOne). Kindle Edition.
- Zahn, Theodor. *Introduction to the New Testament*. (New York, C. Scribner). Kindle Edition.